



Performance Audit of Forest Practices Adaptive Management Program (AMP)

Update on Policy SAO Workgroup Discussions

3/3/2022



Background

- The State Auditor's Office (SAO) completed a performance audit of AMP in January 2021
- SAO provided **13 recommendations** to improve program performance
- The audit report refers **11 recommendations to the FP Board**
- AMP Staff prepared and Board accepted **SAO Performance Audit Work Plan in May 2021**
- Work Plan groups recommendation by priority and assigns development responsibilities to AMP Staff, AMP Committees, and Caucus Principals

“The adaptive management program is not operating as intended. Without change, the program will continue to languish, putting Washington at risk for litigation”



SAO Recommendations

2- Changes to the AMP processes to be evaluated mainly through the appropriate AMP Committee:

Audit report category: **Alleviate delays**

Focus Area	Action Item	Rec #	Cost	Status
Decision making process	Net gains model for project planning	5	Accomplish with existing resources. Recommendations to Board by May 2022	Assigned to Policy and AMPA
Decision making process	Adopt decision criteria for determining actions	6	Accomplish with existing resources. Options paper to Board by November 2022	Planned. Assigned to Policy, CMER and AMPA



Net Gains Model:

“ Use a net gains approach to each **proposal, project, and decision** that benefits more than one caucus by considering **packages of projects** instead of individual projects” SAO

- The Yakima Basin Integrated Plan program pursues a net-gain approach : every project put forward by its program participants aligns with at least one of the six elements that align with stakeholder goals
- The **Snohomish Sustainable Lands Strategy** develops net gains packages that allow the group to take a multi-benefit planning approach.



Net Gains continued...

- “The term “net gains” refers to the principle that the benefits of broad-scale agreements should be greater than the cost for every party involved. No person or group should be expected to accept a net loss so that someone else can gain. Only “win-win” agreements, in which all parties see more gain than loss should be completed under the SLS” Snohomish Sustainable Land Strategy



Policy Workgroup Update

- Policy Workgroup on SAO Recommendation met three times
- Workgroup focused on net gains options for Policy SAO Recommendation 05
- A suite of 6 net gains options are identified
- A draft document is prepared that describes these options for Policy
- Options paper is due to the Board in May 2022
- Policy to receive a draft for review in April for approval in May '22



Net Gains Options

1- Adopt Multi-Criteria Decision Making:

- A logical framework for considering several decision factors simultaneously
- Iterative and rational process. Close to the intent of net gains recommendation for Policy
- Guidance and training needed. Doesn't require changing rules or even BM22

2- Clarify process for Outside Science

- Guidance for incorporating outside science
- Criteria for considering outside science
- Revising the PI process for outside science
- May require rule and BM 22 updates



Net Gains Options Continued...

3- Set clear AMP Priorities

- Clarify master project schedule process in BM22
- Prioritize rule effectiveness studies followed by projects that CWA
- Use multi-criteria decision making process to prioritize
- BM22 update and may not require rule changes

4- Lengthen Dispute Resolution Timelines

- Focus on the informal part of the process
- Extend the timeline to allow time for consensus building
- BM22 guidance on dispute revised/clarified
- Extending timeline requires changing rules



Net Gains Options

5- Revise CMER Membership

- A net gains options for the program at large and not just Policy
- Limit voting membership to one vote per caucus
- CMER to focus on science alone and not on policy issues
- Change in CMER can happen voluntarily by caucus agreement
- Major changes to CMER require rule changes

6- Develop Guidance or Manual for TFW Policy

- Update, revise or adopt a detailed set of committee procedures, guidance and clear roles and responsibilities



SAO Rec # 6

- “Adopt decision criteria for determining actions that will occur depending on project results before those results have been found, such as the ones promoted in *Adaptive Management: The U.S. Department of the Interior Guide*”
SAO Recommendation #6
- AMPA to work with TFW Policy and CMER committee co-chairs and members to develop recommendations for the Board
- AMPA to present option paper to Board by November 2022. Update Board on progress every six months.



