I have perused the new report and compared the results against the previous report. In summary, I think this new report is a tremendous improvement over the old one, due largely to the restructuring it received. I believe that breaking the report into chapters and giving each one a discussion section is very valuable for readers. I also appreciated the section at the end that summarized the relevance of the report for the upcoming BACI study. I believe this document provides readers with much more context simply by placing the context of analysis types in discrete chapters. A targeted reader (e.g., those interested in mainly shade or windthrow) should be able to easily glean valuable information from this report.

The authors also made the report more understandable by streamlining it; they removed extraneous analyses and really focused on bringing out the base summaries for the 11 harvest types. I also thought they did a great job improving the presentation of figures and tables.

I was not able to perform a careful review, but it appears that the meat of the document (data summaries) has not changed much, just the organization. The responses to reviewers' comments were thoughtful and included reasonable explanations of disagreements with / rejections of some comments. With the caveat that I did not review the appendices at all, I find that the document is acceptable without further formal review.

I do recommend (and this probably happens anyway) that the document receive another in-house editing pass-through. I noticed a few things in my skimming of the document that could be tidied up:
- Figure 3: check the alignment of legend items
- There are some floating bullet points with no text
- Figure 6: The cumulative red lines for A and B did not immediately make sense to me, and I was thrown by considering them along with the y-axes on the left of A and the right of B. I think the text summarizes the figure well, I'm not sure the red lines are necessary.

Please let me know if the above material is best passed along to the authors as a separate document.

Best wishes,
Jeremy

Jeremy Groom, Ph.D.
    Pronouns: He/Him/His
Groom Analytics, LLC
541.602.7436
GroomAnalytics.com