

Cooperative Monitoring, Evaluation and Research Committee

Tuesday, September 24, 2024 // 9:00AM – 12:00PM

Virtual: Zoom (Link Listed Below)

In-Person: 401 North Riverpoint Boulevard Spokane, Washington 99202

Motions	
Motion	Move/Second (Vote)
<p>August 2024 Meeting Minutes Chris noted changes.</p> <p>Welles Bretherton moved to approve the August 2024 meeting minutes as amended.</p> <p>The motion passed.</p>	<p>Seconded: Jenny Knoth</p> <p>Up: Joe Murray (proxy for Doug Martin), Aimee McIntyre, Chris Mendoza, A.J Kroll, Hans Berge, Mark Meleason, Jenny Knoth, Mark Mobbs, Harry Bell, Debbie Kay, Julie Dieu</p> <p>Down:</p> <p>Abstain: Todd Baldwin (not present for the August meeting)</p> <p>Absent:</p>
<p>Scoping Template and Guidance Document</p> <p>Motion: Welles Bretherton moved to approve the Scoping Template and Guidance Document.</p> <p>The motion passed.</p>	<p>Seconded: Mark Meleason</p> <p>Up: Doug Martin, Aimee McIntyre, Chris Mendoza, A.J Kroll, Hans Berge, Mark Meleason, Jenny Knoth, Mark Mobbs, Harry Bell, Debbie Kay, Julie Dieu, Todd Baldwin.</p> <p>Down:</p> <p>Abstain:</p> <p>Absent:</p>
<p>Np discontinuous Flow Scoping Document</p> <p>Motion: Harry Bell moved to approve the Np discontinuous Flow Scoping Document.</p> <p>The motion passed.</p>	<p>Seconded: Debbie Kay</p> <p>Up: Doug Martin, Aimee McIntyre, Chris Mendoza, A.J Kroll, Mark Meleason, Jenny Knoth, Mark Mobbs, Harry Bell, Debbie Kay, Julie Dieu, Todd Baldwin</p> <p>Down:</p> <p>Abstain: Hans Berge – UCUT unsure about (budget) priorities for advancing this project. Todd Baldwin – Kalispel Tribes unsure about (budget) priorities for advancing this project.</p> <p>Absent:</p>
<p>Schedule L-1 Subject Matter Experts (SME) Process</p>	<p>Seconded: Mark Mobbs</p>

<p>Motion: Aimee McIntyre moved to approve Schedule L-1 Subject Matter Experts (SME) Process Memo and Guidance.</p> <p>The motion passed.</p>	<p>Up: Doug Martin, Aimee McIntyre, Chris Mendoza, A.J Kroll, Hans Berge, Jenny Knoth, Mark Mobbs, Harry Bell, Debbie Kay, Julie Dieu, and Todd Baldwin.</p> <p>Down:</p> <p>Abstain: Mark Meleason – there are things lacking but will not hold it back. Hans Berge – details missing but will not hold it back.</p> <p>Absent:</p>
--	--

Action Items	
Action Items	Responsibility
ETHEP presentation will be shared with CMER and put on the CMER website following the meeting.	AMP Staff
DPC presentation will be shared with CMER and put on the CMER website following the meeting.	AMP Staff
Check with Todd on SPO access.	Theryn

Welcome, Introductions, & Old Business

Lori welcomed Ash Roorbach as the new CMER co-chair. Aimee McIntyre took roll call. Welles Bretherton made a motion to approve the meeting minutes as amended by Chris Mendoza and Jenny Knoth seconded the motion. Approved.

Ground Rules

- Welles B. Pursue win-win solutions.
- Mark M. Stay on topic.

Staff Updates

- Natalie Church is out on medical leave for approximately 8 weeks.
- As a reminder, AMP staff have worked swiftly to be responsive to the “Zoom bomb” by providing an update to the virtual Zoom platform that will allow a safe environment for the public meetings. Most AMP participants have figured out the new platform and AMP staff continue to make improvements to the meeting management to support inclusive dialogue for members and attendees. AMP staff will be available to assist up until 10 minutes before meetings. Please do not expect a response from AMP staff during meetings. Please log into the meeting at least 10 minutes

in advance of the meeting start time to ensure you can connect and that everything is working for you.

- The USFS is hosting an annual partner meeting for the [Upper Extent of Fish research project](#) on October 16th. At the October 16 Partner Meeting, the Upper Extent of Fish project team will share their progress to date and plans for 2025-2026. The audience will be able to provide feedback and input, and to ask questions of the project team and of each other. Participants from across research, management, stewardship, and policy realms are welcome! The in-person location will be Salem, Oregon, at the Oregon Department of Forestry with an option to join online.
- In addition, on September 26th, they are hosting a webinar about Brooke Penaluna's research describing two novel methods to identify the position of the upper extent of fish that use the UPRIMET model and environmental DNA. These methods uncover how this boundary marks a distinct ecological change in freshwater biodiversity assemblages.
- Lori introduced the newest addition to the AMP staff team, Vaughn Hage. Vaughn is the CMER science technician supporting the water typing projects.

Public Comments

No public comments

TFW Policy Updates

Cody gave an update on what was discussed at the September 2024 Timber Fish and Wildlife (TFW) Policy Committee meeting. Policy discussed Low Impact Conifer Thinning Prescription template and the Westside Type F Exploratory report at the September 2024 meeting.

Eastside Timber Habitat Evaluation Project (ETHEP) Presentation and Update to CMER

Jenny Schofield introduced Ben Spei, ETHEP Principal Investigator, with University of Idaho. Ben gave a presentation. Lori announced that we will be recording the presentation. Jenny shared that Ben will be presenting the ETHEP project framework at the Society for Ecological Function conference next month. The [presentation is on SPO](#) and will be shared with CMER and put on the CMER website following the meeting.

Scoping Template and Guidance Document

Alexander Prescott shared the final Scoping Template and Guidance Document for CMER approval. He received additional feedback from Aimee during the most recent review period, and comments from Harry Bell outside of the review period. Late comments were not incorporated into the CMER mailing document as they were received outside of the comment period. The only change is clarification on which sections are required and which are not required. Harry asked a question about the approval process for the Scoping Template/Document. Approval for the Scoping Template/Document is outlined in the PSM. The Scoping guidance is adapted from existing PSM language. Aimee, Debbie, and Hans thanked Alexander for developing the template. The template was approved.

Adaptive Management Program Legislative Fact Sheet

Lori shared the Legislative Fact Sheet with CMER members to review (9/17-9/24) and offer feedback at the 9/24 meeting. Tim Gates, DNR Legislative Manager, attended the August TFW Policy meeting to share the most effective strategies for TFW Policy to engage with the legislature for the 25-27 biennium budget request. The AMP fact sheet was prepared for TFW Policy members to use when talking with legislators. This may be used alongside letters sent to key legislators the 1st week of December and when we attend in-person meetings in Jan/Feb. Ash suggested we highlight that the program is responsible for managing 9.3 million acres. Harry asked for clarification of small forest landowners versus industrial. Mark asked about adding the past projects into the AMP Dashboard. Welles suggested adding a QR code that links to the AMP Dashboard.

Default Physical Criteria (DPC) Study Design

Anna Toledo introduced Jason Walter, ISAG Co-chair and thanked the Project Team (Mark Meleason, Emma Greenwood, Chris Mendoza, Jason Walter, John Heimburg, Doug Martin, and Jenelle Black) for collaborating to complete the study design. Jason presented an overview of the DPC Study Design. The presentation was recorded and the slides are available on SPO. Harry asked about how to characterize regional differences. Jason said regional differences can be accounted for in the analysis. Ash asked about how the end of fish habitat will be determined. Jason responded that current water typing rule and guidance will be used for the field survey methodologies. Can eDNA be used? The current protocols do not include eDNA. Chris talked about the seasonal electrofishing networks that may yield information about seasonal fish habitat patterns. John said they will be looking at end of fish and habitat under all 3 definitions and any alternative PHBs that are developed. Jenelle added that we are collecting geographical data as a covariate. Debbie asked about how different factors (criteria) systems that are recoverable going to be treated. Jason responded that the teams will employ the same methodologies for all sites. The site selection relies on local expertise on the best time to survey each location. Access at the right times based on local fauna. Aimee shared that the Project Team requests 3 CMER reviewers. Anna shared that the Project Team requests concurrent ISAG/CMER review. All CMER members are encouraged to review the study design within the review period. It is 1.5 weeks beyond the typical 30-day review period to allow more time for CMER review. Chris said that it would be useful to have the PHB CMER reviewers be the same for DPC. Debbie, Harry, Jenny, and Julie agreed to be reviewers. The review period is open, comments are due by November 1, 2024.

Np discontinuous Flow Scoping Document

Ash introduced the agenda item. This project has gone through the review process. Jenny Schofield shared the Np discontinuous Flow Scoping Document has been reviewed and comments were incorporated into the track changes versions. Aimee acknowledged Welles, Mark, Ried, and A.J. and thanked reviewers for the comments/edits. Revisions helped streamline the scoping document to be clearer and more direct. Chris shared that he appreciated the team for responding to his comments. Board is in the CR-102 process thus an effectiveness study would be premature. The timeline will not preclude how the Board concludes their rule making process. This is not a rule effectiveness proposal. It is about characteristics and influences of these stream reaches on natural resources of interest to the AMPs. Doug added that this is not a rule investigation however, this is an essential to provide context around the spatial and temporal variability (flow, temperature, amphibians). We do not have adequate context for rule decisions.

Schedule L-1 (SL-1) Subject Matter Experts (SME) Process

Theryn Henkel shared that the SL-1 workgroup has completed the SME group formation process SME guidance documents. The workgroup met with CMER members who had comments and concerns and had a productive meeting on September 6th to address edits and resolve concerns. Aimee shared that everyone had a positive attitude and collaborated well to make the edits. Jenny Knoth provided additional grammatical edits yesterday. Theryn shared these minor changes. None of the comments changed the intent. Chris shared that the point with prior/active research sentence is to draw attention to projects are designed to inform Performance Targets. These were screened to narrow the focus. Ash thanked Mark Meleason, Debbie Kay, Chris Mendoza, and Welles Bretherton, who were members of the SL1 work group. Hans had concerns about the exclusive use of outside experts and thought it was an inefficient way to go about the process, but said he would not hold up the progress based on this concern. Theryn shared that the SMEs will be providing scientifically justified recommendations and those recommendations will be brought to CMER then TFW Policy for approval. SDM will be used during the approval process.

If approved today, this will be a decision item on the TFW Policy agenda item and, if approved, she will begin working with University of Washington (ISPR) on establishing the SMEs. The SME group formation process was approved.

CMER SAG Updates

Each SAG reviewed the CMER SAG updates document, which was updated live as needed.

List of Attendees

Attendees	Representing
§Baldwin, Todd	Kalispel- Eastern Washington Tribes
§Bell, Harry	WFFA– Small Forest Landowners
§Berge, Hans	UCUT – Eastern Washington Tribes
§Bretherton, Welles	Department of Ecology
§Dieu, Julie	Rayonier
§Kay, Debbie	Suquamish Tribe
§Knoth, Jenny	Washington Farm Forestry Association
§Kroll, A.J.	Large Industrial Landowners
§Martin, Doug	Washington Forest Protection Association
§McIntyre, Aimee	Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife/CMER Co-Chair
§Meleason, Mark	Counties Caucus
§Mendoza, Chris	Conservation Caucus
§Mobbs, Mark	Western Washington Tribes
Austin, Brandon	WDFW/TFW Policy Co-chair
Briggs, Chris	Dept of Ecology, TFW Policy member
Penn, Keith	Makah tribe
Clark, Lori	Adaptive Management Program Administrator
Freeman, Elise	CMER Scientist
Greenwood, Emma	Spokane Tribe
Hage, Vaughn	CMER Science Technician
Henkel, Theryn	DNR Supervisory Project Manager
Heimburg, John	WDFW Habitat Program
Hooks, Doug	WFFA
Mitchell, Robert	Member of the Public
Murray, Joe	Washington Forest Protection Association
Pavlik, Rob	CMER Science Technician
Prescott, Alexander	DNR Project Manager
Purser, Rob	Western Washington Tribes, TFW Policy member
Robbins, Jeff	Department of Ecology
Roorbach, Ash	CMER Co-Chair/Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission
Rubin, Rachel	CMER Scientist
Schofield, Jenny	DNR Project Manager
Spei, Ben	University of Idaho
Stanley, Court	Counties Caucus//TFW Policy Co-chair
Thomas, Cody	UCUT/ WDFW/TFW Policy Co-chair
Toledo, Anna	DNR Project Manager
Walter, Jason	ISAG co-chair
Williamson, Tanner	CMER Scientist

§CMER Voting Member

