

# Cooperative Monitoring, Evaluation and Research Committee

Tuesday, March 25, 2025 // 9:00AM – 2:40PM

Virtual: Zoom (Link Listed Below)

In-Person: 6730 Martin Way E, Olympia, WA 98516

Motions	
Motion	Move/Second (Vote)
<p><b>February 2025 Meeting Minutes</b></p> <p><b><u>Motion:</u></b> Aimee McIntyre moved to approve the February 2025 meeting minutes.</p> <p>The motion passed</p>	<p><b>Seconded:</b> Chris Mendoza</p> <p><b>Up:</b> Harry Bell, A.J. Kroll, Welles Bretherton, Jenny Knoth, Julie Dieu, Chris Mendoza, Aimee McIntyre, Ash Roorbach (Proxy for Mark Mobbs), Mark Meleason, Doug Martin, Hans Berge, Debbie Kay, and Danielle Miles.</p>
<p><b>PSM Edits Workgroup – SAG and Project Team Participation</b></p> <p><b><u>Motion:</u></b> Aimee McIntyre moved to approve the recommended PSM Edits RE SAG and Project Team Participation.</p> <p>The motion passed</p>	<p><b>Seconded:</b> Jenny Knoth</p> <p><b>Up:</b> Harry Bell, A.J. Kroll, Welles Bretherton, Jenny Knoth, Julie Dieu, Chris Mendoza, Aimee McIntyre, Ash Roorbach (Proxy for Mark Mobbs), Mark Meleason, Doug Martin, Hans Berge, Debbie Kay, and Danielle Miles.</p>
<p><b>Riparian Function Literature Review: Disclaimer ("Inside cover letter")</b></p> <p><b><u>Motion:</u></b> Welles Bretherton moved to approve the Riparian Function Literature Review Disclaimer as edited.</p> <p>Aimee McIntyre Friendly Amendment With agreement to reconsider/review the disclaimer template language for potential modification by CMER in an upcoming meeting.</p> <p>The motion failed</p>	<p><b>Seconded:</b> Aimee McIntyre</p> <p><b>Up:</b> Welles Bretherton, Jenny Knoth, Julie Dieu, Aimee McIntyre, A.J. Kroll, Mark Meleason, Debbie Kay, Mark Mobbs, Harry Bell, Danielle Miles, Doug Martin, Hans Berge.</p> <p><b>Down:</b> Chris Mendoza (inconsistent disclaimer language need to follow template)</p>
<p><del><b>Riparian Function Literature Review: 6 Questions Document</b></del></p> <p><b><u>Motion:</u></b> <del>**** moved to approve</del></p> <p><del>The motion passed/failed</del></p> <p>MOVED TO NEXT MONTH</p>	<p><del><b>Seconded:</b></del></p> <p><del><b>Up:</b></del></p> <p><del><b>Down:</b></del></p> <p><del><b>Abstain:</b></del></p> <p><del><b>Absent:</b></del></p>

Action Items	
Action Items	Responsibility
Send out science session PowerPoint presentation. <a href="#">Walter Fish Variability Presentation (CMER March 25 2025).pdf</a>	Natalie Church
Riparian Function Literature Review on April 2025 agenda.	Natalie Church
Add expertise (via the drop-down menu) to the SharePoint online <a href="#">2025 CMER Voting Member Roster</a> by 4/1/2025.	CMER voting members
Email Lori potential eDNA presenters by 4/1/2025.	CMER voting members

### Welcome, Introductions, & Old Business

Ash Roorbach, CMER co-chair

Ash Roorbach took roll call

### Ground Rules

- Ash Roorbach read “Be respectful of others.”
- Welles Bretherton read “Pursue win – win solutions.”

### Staff Updates

- CMER Science Conference is delayed until at least the fall. The workgroup will reconvene after the budget is final.
- The CMER and SAG Co-chairs met last week and some action items that needed to be brought to CMER’s attention
  - Reminder of SAG co-chair elections are in May. Please make announcement at upcoming SAG meeting. Elections are held to give opportunity for other SAG members to step up. If SAG Co-chairs no longer want to be co-chair and no one is stepping up reach out to AMPA.
  - Remind CMER voting members to review CMER agenda and materials prior to the meeting, if they have any concerns. reach out to CMER/SAG co-chairs to help resolve any concerns prior to the meeting.

### Review Last Month Action Items

Natalie Church reviewed the below action items:

- PowerPoint Presentation and recording of science session on SharePoint.
  - Natalie Church put the presentation and recording on SharePoint here: [Presentations and Recordings](#)
- Create Riparian Literature Function Review 6 Questions
  - Ash Roorbach and Chris Mendoza met last week.
- Send template for 6 questions to Ash Roorbach and Chris Mendoza
  - Lori Clark sent template to Ash Roorbach and Chris Mendoza
- Riparian Literature Function Review 6 Questions on March CMER meeting agenda
  - Agenda item on today’s meeting
- Send calendar invite for Type N Phase III – Amphibian Demographics Final Report dispute informal meeting on March 14, 2025, 10:00AM-12:00PM

- Calendar invite was sent to CMER members.

### **Public Comments**

No public comments

### **TFW Policy Updates**

Rico Vinh gave an update on what was discussed at the March 2025 Timber Fish and Wildlife (TFW) Policy Committee meeting.

### **Variability in Upstream Extent of Fish Distribution in Headwater Streams in Southwest Washington**

Jason Walter gave a presentation on the “Variability in Upstream Extent of Fish Distribution in Headwater Streams in Southwest Washington” project completed by Weyerhaeuser. Natalie Church will send out the PowerPoint presentation. A manuscript will be released shortly describing this work.

### **5-Year Science Review**

CMER five-year peer review process is required in WAC 222-12-045(2)(f) although it is not specific about what is included in this 5-year review. CMER has never had an official 5-year review. Lori met with WDFW regarding the AMP science review that is being done on the first 20 years of the AMP. WDFW requested that she ask CMER for input on what would be most helpful to see in a 5-year review. Ash Roorbach mentioned that we can use the CMER Work Plan to complete this. Jenny Knoth explained that she is more partial to doing a synthesis. Develop questions to complete synthesis. Mark Mobbs suggested that CMER identify “what comes next” to sequence future projects. Chris Mendoza said that we should go back and review to see if CMER has followed the prior independent reviews such as the Stillwater Report and LEAN. Ash shared that if critical questions change, it could shift the format of future CMER reviews. Hans shared in the chat, WAC 222-12-045(2)(f): “CMER five-year peer review process. Every five years the board will establish a peer review process to review all work of CMER and other available, relevant data, including recommendations from the CMER staff. There will be a specified, but limited, period for public review and comment.” Welles explained what would be helpful would be to have an easily accessible centralized location of CMER conclusions, findings, and lessons learned. Chris indicated that the report WDFW is working on will cover a lot of what Welles requested. Aimee indicated that the pending report is covering 2000 through 2020 and therefore will not cover the most recent 5 years (2020 –2025) of the program. She suggested that CMER wait and see the WDFW report and assess if it provides a good template that can be used to do the 5-year updates or if it should be modified slightly. There was a general agreement on that being a good path. Aimee also explained that while small modifications to the report could happen, a large pivot, based on CMER or TFW Policy recommendations is not likely, given the timeline for the reports release. Lori explained that the next step is that she will reach out to TFW Policy and get their suggestions then she will follow up with CMER and WDFW.

### **Riparian Function Literature Review: Disclaimer ("Inside cover letter") & 6 Questions Document**

Ash gave a brief explanation that was discussed last month. The disclaimer (“Inside Cover Letter”) was shared on the screen and there was discussion on suggested comments and edits. There was discussion around the language of the disclaimer template. Chris Mendoza suggested that we use the language from option (d) in the template, but that option was already used in paragraph 1. There was disagreement about the second paragraph and changing the verbiage slightly from what already exists in the template. There was a vote on the modified language and Chris voted down on the modified language, indicating that the template should not be changed for individual reports. It was suggested that there be a discussion about editing the template since some found the last two sentences in Paragraph 2 to be contradictory. Discussion ran over the time allotted on the agenda, and as a result the 6 Questions document was not discussed. These items will be on the April agenda for discussion.

### **CMER Expertise**

The Forest Practices Board (Board) requested that the AMPA work with CMER to identify each member’s scientific expertise. The Board tasked CMER with advancing the science needed to support the Adaptive Management Program (AMP). As such, the WAC maintains that CMER will be made up of members that have expertise in “a scientific discipline that will enable them to be most effective in addressing forestry, fish, wildlife, and landscape process issues. Members will represent timber landowners, environmental interests, state agencies, county governments, federal agencies and tribal governments from a scientific standpoint, not a policy view.” Lori explained that this request from the Board was to aid the Board in evaluating where there were gaps in scientific expertise and knowledge among CMER voting members that could be considered when a new member is up for approval in front of the Board. Jenny suggested that we add skills such as research design/implementation expertise, statistical design, etc.

Chris suggested that we inform the Board how we fill the gaps in the expertise, that caucuses can hire contractors to participate on their behalf if the expertise does not already exist where needed. Harry suggested the 4 categories need a criterion. Aimee suggested that, since with caucus representative needs, replacement is random (not based on terms), it would be unfair to the caucus bringing a representative for approval to have to fill a specific knowledge gap or not have their recommended candidate considered solely on a lack of experience in one particular area. CMER is a cooperative/collective that can fill knowledge gaps via multiple avenues include CMER scientists, contractors, volunteer subject matter experts, etc. Lori said that she would report these concerns and comments to the Board.

Please add your expertise (via the drop-down menu) to the SharePoint online [2025 CMER Voting Member Roster](#).

### **PSM Edits Workgroup – SAG and Project Team Participation**

The workgroup met twice to work through edits/comments to get agreement on language. There was a slight modification to the text, edited live during the meeting. The existing and new edits were approved. The approved edits will be added to the PSM.

### **eDNA TFW Policy/CMER Joint Learning Session**

TFW Policy requested that Jenny Knoth provide an update on the eDNA CMER workgroup at their April meeting and they are requesting a joint learning session with CMER at the May or June TFW Policy meeting. They have requested a presentation on the use of eDNA in forest practices research and monitoring. Lori asked CMER for input on potential presenters. CMER will be invited to join the meeting and participate in the learning session. Ash shared to be sure to share the state of the science and the potential limitations of using eDNA. Jenny shared that we should also include the cost of using eDNA. Lori requested that CMER members send suggested presenters on this topic to her by April 1.

### **CMER SAG Updates**

Each SAG reviewed the CMER SAG updates document, which was updated live as needed.

### **List of Attendees**

<b>Attendees</b>	<b>Representing</b>
§Bell, Harry	WFFA– Small Forest Landowners
§Berge, Hans	UCUT – Eastern Washington Tribes
§Bretherton, Welles	Department of Ecology
§Dieu, Julie	Rayonier
§Kay, Debbie	Suquamish Tribe
§Knoth, Jenny	Washington Farm Forestry Association

§Kroll, A.J.	Large Industrial Landowners
§Martin, Doug	Washington Forest Protection Association
§McIntyre, Aimee	Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife/CMER Co-Chair
§Meleason, Mark	Counties Caucus
§Mendoza, Chris	Conservation Caucus
§Miles, Danielle	Department of Natural Resources
§Mobbs, Mark	Westside Tribes
Belleveau, Lisa	Skokomish Tribe
Black, Jenelle	NWIFC CMER Scientist
Church, Natalie	DNR – AMP Coordinator
Clark, Lori	Adaptive Management Program Administrator
Freeman, Elise	CMER Scientist
Hage, Vaughn	CMER Natural Resources Technician
Harris, Catherine	NWIFC
Henkel, Theryn	DNR Supervisory Project Manager
Heimborg, John	WDFW Habitat Program
Hooks, Doug	WFPA
Kautz, Kyle	Nisqually Tribe
Lower, Adam	Chehalis Tribe
Morris, Greg	Yakama Fish
Mitchell, Robert	Member of the Public
Murray, Joe	Washington Forest Protection Association
Pavlik, Rob	CMER Natural Resources Technician
Prescott, Alexander	DNR Project Manager
Rivers, Ann	Hampton Lumber
Robbins, Jeff	Department of Ecology
Roorbach, Ash	CMER Co-Chair/Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission
Schofield, Jenny	DNR Project Manager
Terry, Christopher	Quileute Tribe
Toledo, Anna	DNR Project Manager
Vinh, Rico	Conservation/TFW Policy Co-chair
Walter, Jason	Weyerhaeuser
Williamson, Tanner	CMER Scientist

§CMER Voting Member