

**Cooperative Monitoring Evaluation and Research Committee
(CMER)
November 15, 2016
DNR/DOC Compound/Tumwater, WA**

Attendees	Representing
§Baldwin, Todd (ph)	Kalispel Tribe – CMER Co-Chair
Beckett, Leah	Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission – CMER Staff
§Bell, Harry	Green Crow
Berge, Hans	Adaptive Management Program Administrator
§Ehinger, Bill	Ecology
Gibbs, Heather	Department of Natural Resources
Haemmerle, Howard	Department of Natural Resources
§Hicks, Mark (ph)	Department of Ecology
Gauthier, Marc	Upper Columbia United Tribes
Garlesky, Jennifer	Upper Columbia United Tribes – CMER Staff
Hooks, Doug	WFPA – CMER Co-Chair
Johnson, Angela	Department of Natural Resources
§Kay, Debbie	Suquamish Tribe
§Knoth, Jenny	Green Crow
§Kroll, A.J.	Weyerhaeuser
§Martin, Doug	Washington Forest Protections Association
§Mendoza, Chris	Conservation Caucus
Murray, Joe	Merrill Ring
Regmi, Netra (ph)	Northwest Indian Fisheries Commissions – CMER Staff
Schuetz-Hames, Dave	Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission - CMER Staff
Shramek, Patti	Department of Natural Resources – CMER Coordinator
Stewart, Greg (ph)	Northwest Indian Fisheries Commission - CMER Staff
Walter, Jason	Weyerhaeuser
Woodsmith, Rick	Private Consultant

§Indicates official CMER members and alternates; ph indicates attended via phone.

*Indicates Decision

Agenda changes:

ENREP update moved up directly after decision items.

Science Session:

Lean Process – presentation

Howard Haemmerle gave a presentation on the history of Lean process in the Adaptive Management Program and went over his recommendations on improvements. The review highlighted the timelines for each decision step of each study, but did not evaluate the causes for

delay or make a comparison to the former SAG driven process guided by the PSM. There was discussion about how the process has been working, what the road blocks have been, and how to move forward. Howard provided recommendations on how to improve the process.

Next Steps: Everyone think about the process and recommendations as well as additional analysis that the review did not include over the next few weeks send their recommendations to Haemmerle by December 2, 2016.

Decisions:

Forested Wetlands TWIG

***Best Available Science (BAS) – approval**

Leah Beckett reviewed how the comments were addressed in the document. Discussion revolved around how the document was revised and if it was sufficient to approve the document. Beckett requested approval to send the BAS document and recommendations to Policy.

Mendoza motioned to approve document contingent on making clarification changes made by Mark Hicks and Doug Martin. Hicks seconded – Approved.

Next steps: Clarifying comments due to Beckett by close of business Wednesday, November 16, 2016. The document will be sent out to the CMER listserv as soon as it is revised. Beckett will attend the December 1, 2016 Policy meeting to give a presentation.

LWAG

*** Type N Experimental Buffer Treatment Study – Basalt Lithologies (Hard Rock – approval of Chapter 12.**

Haemmerle gave an update of the ISPR review of Chapter 12 (Litter Fall Input and Detritus Export) and requested approval to send to Policy. Mendoza remarked that he felt that Amy McIntyre did a good job of responding to ISPR comments.

Hicks motioned to approve to send Chapter 12 to Policy, Kay seconded - approved

WetSAG

***Wetlands Mapping Tool – request for funding for completion of Phase I of project**

Debbie Kay reviewed the progress of the project and asked for approval of budget to complete Phase I of the project. Discussion revolved around next steps and the cost of the project moving forward. This was a Fiscal Year 16 mid-year project. CMER needs to decide how they will handle projects that aren't on the Master Project Schedule in the future. Kay will arrange to have a presentation on the mapping tool at the December CMER meeting.

Knott moved to approve SAG request and that it be funded with non-spent FY 16 funds, Martin seconded. Todd Baldwin opposed. – Not approved

Next Steps: Baldwin requested that more specific explanations of deliverables and costs be presented at the December meeting. Martin asked for Baldwin (and anyone else with concerns)

provide a written request of what he would like to see on the December request. Comments will be sent to Kay and Angela Johnson by Wednesday, November 16, 2016. A presentation will be given at the December meeting, along with the request.

Berge remarked that communication between CMER members and contractors needs to be up front so all of CMER is aware of what it happening.

Steps for approval of projects that aren't on the Master Project Schedule and use of unspent funds need to be solidified.

SAGE

***EMEP** – *approval to not send report to ISPR*

Baldwin gave an update on the approval process for the report and explained why they recommend not sending the report to CMER. Berge clarified that this step was missed when CMER approved sending the report to Policy with the recommendations and six questions. Discussion revolved around what the report will be used for, what had been done on the project in the past, and whether or not any of them had gone through ISPR. Hicks remarked that since this is a final report he thinks it needs to go through ISPR.

Hicks moved to send the report to ISPR, Bell seconded. Baldwin voted sideways, Martin opposed. **Not Approved**

Next Steps: Report must be sent through ISPR since there was no consensus.

CMER

***Meeting Minutes Approval** – *September 2016 meeting minutes*

Patti Shramek asked for approval of the September 2016 CMER meeting minutes. Kay moved to approve, Knoth seconded. - **Approved**

UPDATES:

Report from Board – *November 8&9 meeting*

Berge gave a report on the November 8&9, 2016 Forest Practices Board meeting. Minutes for the meeting can be found on the Department of Natural Resources web page at <http://www.dnr.wa.gov/about/boards-and-councils/forest-practices-board>.

Report from Policy – *October 6, 19, and November 3 meetings*

Hans Berge gave a report on the October 6, 19, and November 3, 2016 Policy meetings. Minutes for the meeting can be found on the Department of Natural Resources web page at <http://www.dnr.wa.gov/about/boards-and-councils/forest-practices-board/tfw-policy-committee>.

CMER

- ◆ **2017 CMER Science Conference** – *discussion of topics and dates*
Agreement to have conference day after the April CMER meeting, pending logistical needs may be met. Hooks and Baldwin will work with SAGs to get a list of presentations to review at the December meeting.
- ◆ **CMER Work Plan** – *update*
SAGS are on track to get Work Plan updates on schedule.
- ◆ **2016 Accomplishments Document** – *discussion*
Shramek will send out accomplishments document to SAG co-chairs to update for December meeting.
- ◆ **October 25 Forest Chemicals Science Session** – *update*
Knoth gave a wrap up on the session. Hooks reported that he has heard many compliments about it. The PowerPoint presentations will be loaded on the DNR external website.
- ◆ **Protocol and Standards Manual Chapter 7** – *update*
Haemmerle reported that they are still working on incorporating the comments and it will most likely come to CMER for approval in January.

SAGS

- ◆ **ISAG**
Jason Walter reported that ISAG members are working on research questions and submitting them to him. Their next meeting is Tuesday, November 21, 2016. Caprice Fasano will no longer be a Co-chair. Marc Gauthier has stepped in, which gives the Eastern Washington tribes representation.
- ◆ **LWAG**
 - **Van Dykes**
Berge reported that literature review is underway and on schedule.
 - **Buffer Shade**
Joe Murray reported that report is scheduled to go to Jim McCracken in December. They are unsure about how long it will take him to complete it and get it back to LWAG.
- ◆ **RSAG**
 - **Hardwood Conversion**
Murray reported that Haemmerle is working with Kevin Cedar on a contract to write the report. The 2016 case reports are done.
 - **Remote Sensing**
Murray reported that the field work is finished and they are now working on the metrics. The project is still on time and on budget.

◆ **UPSAG**

➤ **Deep-Seated Landslides Literature Synthesis**

Murray reported that they worked on the Work Plan and with Dan on the non-glacial literature synthesis at the last meeting.

◆ **TWIGS**

➤ **Eastern Washington Type N Riparian Effectiveness Project** (*study plan*)

Hooks and Haemmerle reported that the TWIG incorporated the changes to the study plan and it was distributed November 9 as well as a memo from the TWIG. The memo was prepared in response to direction from CMER (an agreement amongst the participants of the dispute resolution process). Hooks remarked that, even though the Study Plan was not on the agenda as a decision item, it can still be voted on at this meeting if everyone is agreeable.

Bill Ehinger reviewed the changes to the study plan and treatments, and explained why the TWIG doesn't agree with all the treatments. Discussion revolved around the different treatments and why they are included in the Study Plan. Hicks remarked that he didn't want to go back over past history and would like to move forward. He also offered to remove one of the treatments that he had requested if it would help move the Study Plan forward.

Baldwin expressed concerns with moving the study design forward. He referenced the TWIGs memo as well as issues with insufficient funding and/or the availability of study sites. He further stated that he would only support a study that prioritized Effectiveness monitoring and met BAS.

Bell moved to forward the study plan, as is, to ISPR with a supplemental question. Hicks seconded. Baldwin voted sideways. - Approved

➤ **BMP Roads Effectiveness Project** (*study plan*)

Haemmerle reported that the TWIG is meeting again on Thursday, November 17, 2016. Dave Schuett-Hames reported that Netra Regmi has been hired as the geologist at NWIFC and he is assigned to the Roads TWIG. Greg Stewart reported that they are still a ways away from being ready. He said that there are some differences of opinion on the TWIG and they are working them out.

➤ **Unstable Slopes Criteria** (*BAS*)

Stewart reported that they are making slow progress on the BAS document and will probably have something ready for CMER review in January.

➤ **Type F Riparian Prescriptions** (*study plan*)

Schuett-Hames reported that they have located a statistician from the Forest Service to help with some of the final issues in the study design. The Study Plan will probably be ready for CMER review in January/February.

Public Comment Period

None.

Recap of Assignments/Decisions

- ◆ Comments on Lean recommendations due to Howard Haemmerle by December 2, 2016.
- ◆ Forested Wetland TWIGs BAS approved contingent on clarification changes made by Mark Hicks and Doug Martin.
- ◆ Forested Wetland TWIG BAS clarification changes due to Leah Beckett by Wednesday, November 16, 2016.
- ◆ Type N Hard Rock Chapter 12 approved to go to Policy.
- ◆ WetSAG Wetland Mapping Tool request will be resubmitted with more details at the December meeting.
- ◆ Todd Baldwin will send a list of the details he would like to see in the Wetland Mapping request to Debbie Kay and Angela Johnson by Wednesday, November 16, 2016.
- ◆ A presentation on the Wetland Modeling Tool will be given at the December meeting.
- ◆ The EMEP report will be sent to ISPR.
- ◆ September 2016 meeting minutes approved.
- ◆ The ENREP Study Plan will be sent to ISPR with a supplemental question. Hicks
- ◆ The 2017 CMER Science Conference will be held the day after the April CMER meeting (April 26, 2016). Doug Hooks and Todd Baldwin will work with the SAGs to get a list of presentations to review at the December meeting.
- ◆ Patti Shramek will send out the 2016 CMER Accomplishments document to SAG co-chairs to update for review at the December CMER meeting.
- ◆ Hans Berge will distribute the resumes of the new members of the Roads and Unstable Slopes TWIGS a couple of weeks before the December CMER meeting.
- ◆ End of FY16 budget status and update on FY17 budget.

Adjourned