Minutes

Board of Natural Resources Meeting July 5, 2023

Webinar/In-Person, Olympia, Washington

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Dr. Dan Brown,	Vice Chair &	Director,	School of	f Environment	al and	Forest	Sciences
University of Wa	ashington						

The Honorable Chris Reykdal, Superintendent of Public Instruction

The Honorable Lisa Janicki, Commissioner, Skagit County

Jim Cahill, Designee for the Honorable Jay Inslee, Washington State Governor

Dr. Wendy Powers, Dean, College of Agricultural, Human, and Natural Resource Sciences,

Washington State University

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT

The Honorable Hilary Franz, Chair & Washington State Commissioner of Public Lands

CALL TO ORDER

1

2

3 4

5 6

7

8

9 10

11

12

13

14

15 16

17 18

Vice Chair Dan Brown called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

Board members provided self-introduction. A meeting quorum was confirmed.

WEBINAR/SAFETY BRIEFING

Tami Kellogg, Board Coordinator, outlined how to view and participate in the combined webinar and in-person meeting.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES - June 6, 2023 - Action

Vice Chair Brown requested consideration of a motion to approve the minutes of June 6, 2023.

MOTION: Mr. Cahill moved to approve the minutes as published.

SECOND: Superintendent Reykdal seconded the motion.

ACTION: The motion carried unanimously.

LIGHTNING TALK - Information

Stream Temperature Monitoring in Olympic Experimental State Forest (OESF)

Teodora Minkova, OESF Research & Monitoring Manager

Ms. Minkova briefed the Board on data from an ongoing monitoring project in the OESF located within the Olympic Experimental State Forest (OESF). The project was designed as a monitoring study to evaluate riparian conservation measures in the OESF from implementing measures for riparian buffers, protection of unstable slopes, wetlands, stream temperatures, and the cumulative effect of stream habitat for salmon. The project was not designed to evaluate the effects of specific timber sales on stream temperature.

2 3

Data from eight years of monitoring are included in a recent published report, Status and Trends Monitoring Riparian and Aquatic Habitat in the Olympic Experimental State Forest. The study monitored nine environmental indicators in response to the Department's commitment for effectiveness monitoring for state lands to comply with the Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP) riparian conservation strategy to document long-term change in habitat conditions in watersheds managed by DNR.

 The monitoring project covered 50 watersheds selected to represent ecological conditions across the OESF. DNR also manages other unmanaged watersheds referred to as reference watersheds located in lower elevations. DNR conducts regular management practices across the managed watersheds. Over the last 10 years of monitoring, 18 of the 50 watersheds were not harvested, 19 watersheds were harvested 1% to 10%, eight watersheds were harvested 11% to 20%, and five watersheds were harvested less than 20%.

Data were collected using stream temperature augers recording temperatures every hour year-round since 2013. Detailed protocols are published on DNR's website on how data are collected and managed. The study produced 9 million datapoints. It is possible to characterize stream temperature regimes in many ways. One study metric is the average daily stream temperature for all 50 watersheds during the 10-year monitoring period. The warmest periods are from May through November. The average daily temperature remains low throughout the summer. The heat dome in June 2021 increased stream temperature.

A second metric is the maximum summer temperatures. The metric is widely used throughout the U.S. by regulatory authorities including the Washington Department of Ecology. The metric is the seven-day maximum of the highest temperature of the seven hottest days. The maximum summer temperature across all 50 watersheds during the 10 years averaged 14.4°C. Less than 8% of the watershed temperatures exceeded the 16° C regulatory threshold. During the monitoring period, watersheds exceeding the threshold were in 2015 and 2021. The study revealed a wide range of temperature conditions naturally occurring across the landscape.

Statistical modeling was used to detect various factors affecting maximum summer stream temperature. Results are reflective of whether the effects are from natural factors or from management. Ms. Minkova reviewed predictors of maximum summer temperature on 50 DNR-managed watersheds by year based on gradient, channel width, elevation, shade, channel bedrock, solar exposure, and watershed harvest during the last five years.

Superintendent Reykdal asked about any variables for measuring water volume. Ms. Minkova confirmed the study measured channel morphology and the depth of water. The results revealed no significant effects. The monitoring report includes information on the depth of water with a section on stream flows. Staff continues to work on more in-depth analysis. The partial analysis within the report focused on peak flows. She offered to follow-up with additional information on stream depth and its effect on temperature.

Ms. Minkova reported the study revealed OESF stream temperatures remain cool during the summer. Natural factors explained most of the temperature variation. Year-to-year changes in stream temperature show climate influence. Cause-effect relationships between timber harvest and stream temperature will be evaluated during the ongoing management experiment in the OESF.

Vice Chair Brown inquired about the possibility of separating the kinds of management and its effects during the T3 Watershed Experiment. Ms. Minkova affirmed the possibility of separating the types of management; however, the combined data revealed no significant effects. The T3 Watershed Experiment will focus on stand age and adjacent buffers, as well as unmanaged buffers and a series of management practices within the buffers.

Mr. Cahill asked about the timeline for completion of the T3 Watershed Experiment. Ms Minkova said staff initiated planning in 2016 with the launch in 2018. Staff currently is collecting pre-harvest data in 16 watersheds scheduled for experimentation that began in 2020. The management experiment is implemented through 12 timber sales of which 11 sales have been sold. Staff will evaluate post-harvest monitoring and document the effects of different experimental practices. The amount of pre-harvesting monitoring data is used for some analysis with more findings following the conclusion of the experiment. The end date of the experiment is October 2025. In conjunction with the experiment is stakeholder cooperation through eight learning groups with various stakeholders involved in different learning topics.

In response to questions about any trend in higher temperature because of climate change, Ms. Minkova said data have reflected some variation during the 10-year collection process but no clear trends.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Robert Mitchell commented on how the meetings represent a bubble to the average person because of the disconnect between prevailing assumptions and the way most people experience life. Public comments are a crucial check on democratic government and possible abuses of power. He recalled his experience when he first began attending meetings and how if he pointed out glaring inconsistencies and mistakes in plain language, things might have changed; however, power speaks another language. He is trying to learn how to convey his message more effectively. He urged conservationists to give logging industry representatives their safe space, as they will use any rhetorical threat of violence cynically to shut down all public input and/or access to public lands. He urged negotiation of prices with the logging industry as a way to reduce the loss of timber volume. DNR should not guide people to

developed campgrounds because many people prefer dispersed camping.

Sherri Dysart, resident of Mason County, cited the June 27, 2023 non-violent rally at DNR to call attention to the need for meaningful dialogue and appropriate action by the Department to protect ecosystems key to stabilizing climate. The coalition demands an end to all clearcut logging on all mature forests on public lands. DNR should engage in environmental justice and include tribal and community members as representatives in all decision-making bodies to include DNR and the budget proviso workgroup. DNR should double harvest rotation lengths on private lands, end herbicide and pesticide spraying and monoculture replanting on recently logged land, fully fund schools and counties from sources other than logging, commit Climate Commitment Act funding to real climate solutions, and remove timber industry-funded science from public universities.

Jim Oliver spoke in opposition of the Ridge Ender timber sale, a clearcut of the remaining 144-forested acres of a steep 800-acre ridge above the Sultan River in Snohomish County. The entire ridge has been recently clearcut and because the slopes are so steep, the hill is collapsing into the river. While walking through the forest, he observed several older Douglas fir trees over six feet in diameter, which were marked as leave trees. Hemlocks surrounding them of 40 to 50 inches in diameter were not marked as leave trees. Other units revealed slopes averaging 45 degrees with exposed rocky cliffs. Navigating the terrain was like backpacking in the high Cascades. A look across the valley at DNR's previous clearcuts revealed the future of planned clearcuts with baron cliff sides of rocks and dirt washing into the Sultan River. He urged everyone to look into the Ridge Ender timber sale to verify his concerns.

Zephyr Elise said she lives several miles from the current fire in Mason County. The records should reflect how hard many people are working to ensure everyone has an opportunity to thrive. She is sorry for this era of greed by the timber industry, as it has blinded those in power of their duty to protect the planet. Those in the timber industry believe activists are demanding the end of extractive capitalism. In fact, it is the world demanding the end of all fossil fuel extractions as well as the current method of plantation stands clearcut and logged even if branded as a sustainable variable retention harvest. A rapidly warming earth demands change. The previous day was the hottest day recorded in history at 17.01 °C. The record will likely be broken repeatedly this summer and it is not an achievement to celebrate. As the current system makes abundantly clear, people lack power and voice. However, no one from the lowest office intern to the highest CEO will ever be more powerful than ancient mother earth as she is changing quickly and demands change rapidly or be prepared not to survive.

Dr. Julie Ratner played a recording from Dr. Dominick A. Dellasala, Chief Scientist with Wild Heritage. A quote from Dr. Dellasala confirms how essential it is to start embracing the sustainable harvest metric to understand how essential trees are for the survival of earth.

Donna Albert, Grays Harbor, cited the carbon dynamics of West Coast forests published by Oregon State University on managing forests for climate benefit with full carbon accounting. There is a large carbon cost to the initial conversion of the landscape dominated by old forests versus one dominated by young forests. Managing forests to maximize net primary

production (MNPP) may not have an effect on maximum regional carbon storage. Maximum MNPP is reached much earlier in stand development than maximum biomass in all ecoregions by hundreds of years. Limiting biomass accumulation to rotation ages based on maximum MNPP would reduce land-based stocks. Highly productive ecoregions with infrequent fires such as the coast range are most likely to reach potential stocks if managed for maximum biomass accumulation. Maintaining mature and older forests storing large amounts of carbon is a mitigation option as suggested by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC). She is hopeful the Department is including everything in the life cycle when determining timber sales. She referred to other information on using wood versus more fossil fuel intensive materials. There are some problems with the assumptions used by DNR. Growing trees for bioenergy production competes with forest carbon sequestration.

Ed Chadd, Port Angeles, mentioned a 100-acre fire off the Joyce access road in a DNR clearcut, as well as another fire discovered earlier in the morning in another DNR clearcut. In spite of promises from the Commissioner of Public Lands, there is no policy on older forests. He appreciated the recording of Dominick A. Dellasala because it is time for Commissioner Franz and the Board to call for an older forest policy, a moratorium on cutting older forests, and clarification that the carbon project is separate from the natural climate solutions funding. Future presentations should be provided on the \$2.5 million stakeholder group responsible for overseeing the process. The information should identify participants of the group and whether they will be provided the resources to participate effectively, whether environmental justice provisions in Healthy Environment for All (HEAL) Act will be followed, identification of presenters to the group, and whether best available science and social science would be assured.

Paul Butler, Thurston County, urged the Board to implement a moratorium on timber sales of mature and old forests in Western Washington. Commissioner Franz and staff have recently justified the Department's Forest management approach in part because Jerry Franklin stated that DNR is an exemplary natural resource agency. On at least two occasions, Dr. Franklin indicated the Department still has a way to go. Recently, Politico published an editorial by Norm Christianson and Jerry Franklin on "New Trees Are No Substitute for Old Trees." They concluded that there are ample forests on private land to meet future needs for timber and letting mature forests on public lands age is the best opportunity to diminish carbon emissions and mitigate catastrophic wildfire threatening the health of humans and the planet. DNR does not appear to be listening. DNR timber sales lack a range of stand origin dates making it difficult to determine how many older forests are included. That amount should be zero until the Department completes a thorough analysis of disappearing forests and develops a clear policy for management. DNR and the Board can meet trust obligations into the near future by managing existing plantations for timber production. Now is the time for DNR to be exemplary. Let the state manage mature forests so the lowlands in Western Washington continue to grow to reduce the risk of wildfires and to sequester carbon.

 Ed Bowen, Clallam County, commented on the importance of the Sustainable Harvest Calculation (SHC) as the region is reported to experience an arrearage on this year's harvest cycle. His concern is with proposed operable acres because the region is learning about potential impacts caused by the possible Trust Land Transfer Program proviso deferment

affecting the two counties. The laundry list of options may be a deferment, and if so, he asked about the policies to create to eliminate the deferments. Another issue is how questionable old growth is in preventing access to harvestable timber. The county has received no public information on the HCP for Western Washington since 2021. The only form of information is by attending monthly Board meetings. The Board needs to address the Western Washington SHC and its plans to address operable acres. Additionally, the OESF should be delineated between Clallam and Jefferson Counties as it affects two independent trust counties.

Brian Karnes said his comments are reflective of a concerned Washington resident. As the husband of a junior high school math teacher and father of two public school graduates, he is thankful for efforts by DNR staff to generate revenue for the public school system, rural fire districts, and other junior taxing districts. He is concerned with the direction of DNR's timber sales program and the amount of volume not being offered or set-aside. It is vital to junior taxing districts and to the public school system to meet the established targets of timber volume as districts develop budgets based on timber revenue.

Matt Comisky, American Forest Resource Council, thanked Ms. Minkova for the Lightning Talk presentation as she and her colleagues do not receive sufficient credit for their work in the OESF. He thanked timber sales staff and Northwest Region staff both in State Lands and Forest Practices for their assistance with the Whatcom Women and Timber Tour last month. The tour was very informative for many members of the public who participated. Last month, the state imported 1.3 mmbf of lumber or approximately 30% of wood consumption. Importing timber creates a carbon footprint. He is concerned about missing goals and themes in the Recreation Report. The trust mandate is missing and the report should define "nonmarket benefits." Although the report refers to beneficiaries, it is questionable as to how rural communities benefit from recreation activities. Based on Clallam County data, the upper end of recreation and hospitality jobs pay approximately \$27,000 a year with no benefits.

Rod Fleck, City of Forks, spoke about two fires in his area and the work of the fire crews. He shared how the community came together in support and noted his comments via email sent last month are still there and valid.

Bill Turner, Sierra Pacific Industries, said the timber sales presentation includes a preview of fiscal year 2024 timber sales plans. The year begins with a blank slate with expectations of achieving the plan 100%. The presentation includes a review of the 2023 plan and accomplishments in looking in how it measures up to those plans. Last July, DNR presented a plan to sell 574.2 mmbf with the actual volume sold of 477 mmbf or a 97.2 mmbf shortfall. With average sale prices last year, the reduction in volume represents approximately \$40 million in lost revenue to beneficiaries and DNR. For the timber purchasing community, it also represents missed opportunities and adds to struggles the industry encounters keeping contractors and employees employed and mills operating at capacity. DNR's successes and shortfalls affect businesses and communities. He encouraged DNR and the Board to pursue efforts to the extent possible to achieve the planned fiscal year 2024 timber volume target. With decadal arrearage of more than 200 mmbf for Western Washington timber sales, the Department cannot afford to fall short. The report to the Board also is a continuation of the

Recreation Report on DNR managed lands. The DNR Recreation Program works in conjunction with the timber sales program through bridge replacements, parking lot clearings, and trail restorations. Mr. Turner thanked the Board for approving timber sales supporting local beneficiaries, communities, recreation, and businesses.

Doug Cooper, Hampton Lumber, reported the company helps to sustain healthy forests and contributes to rural and urban economies. The 2022 SHC Plan timber volume was approximately 564 mmbf with 435 mmbf sold representing a shortfall of 129 mmbf for an average stumpage price of \$410 per mbf, which resulted in lost revenue to the Department and trust beneficiaries of \$52.9 million. In July 2022, the SHC Plan sales volume for fiscal year 2023 was 564 mmbf and later reduced by 80 mmbf with total sales of 466 mmbf, a shortfall of 98 mmbf at an average stumpage price of \$390 per mbf representing a loss of \$38 million. The two-year loss in revenue was \$90 million. Another scheduled presentation reveals the SHC Plan sales volume of 562 mmbf for fiscal year 2024. As in the past, he asked what action or direction the Board is providing to staff to ensure meeting the planned sales volume. He thanked DNR staff for wildfire protection as he learned of a small fire from July Fourth celebrations on the company's property north of Eatonville. The company's forester visited the site and found the fire had been extinguished by DNR firefighters.

Miguel Perez-Gibson, Washington Conservation Action, commented on public opposition to timber sales over the last several years at nearly each Board meeting. It may be the opposition is less about selling timber than it is about forest management. Less opposition would be likely if DNR employed a list of the following nine practices:

- 1. Retain very large diameter structurally unique trees to meet DNR's Habitat Conservation Plan requirements for large structurally unique trees.
- 2. Conservation efforts that focus on biodiversity, a fundamental principle of a sustainable forest management.
- 3. Assess potential for significant cumulative impacts on watersheds and mitigate.
- 4. Identify forested state trust lands with ecological features that build critical gaps in ecosystem diversity.
- 5. Protect and enhance a diverse gene pool of native trees to ensure well adapted future forests
- 6. Consider whether management activities have visual impacts and design appropriate mitigation strategies.
- 7. Use intensive silviculture to guide the progression of stand development and create structural diversity across the landscape.
- 8. Target 10% to 15% of the HCP planning units for older forests.
- 9. Identify suitable, structural complex forest stands to manage to help meet older forest targets.

All of the practices are from the 2006 Board of Natural Resources Policy for Sustainable Forests. It may be time to ask how the policies can be more routinely implemented by DNR field foresters.

Lee First, resident of Thurston County, referred to the proposed Misty timber sale that drains to Gibson and Cedar Creeks in the Chehalis watershed. The Chehalis River is less than

one mile from the proposed sale. Today, the Chehalis River at Grand Mound is flowing 89 cubic feet per second, which is the lowest ever recorded for July 5, 2023 in the last 94 years of record-keeping. Gibson and Cedar Creeks are critical sources of clean cold water for the Chehalis River. Retaining legacy forests in the Capitol Forest will greatly assist in maintaining critical flows and cold water to the Chehalis River. Lacking big older trees, the region will face increasingly dire low flows, warm water, and algae blooms. The timber unit contains increasingly rare, naturally revegetated carbon-rich, structurally complex forests, which are increasingly rare in the Chehalis watershed. Action by the Board could mean the difference between having salmon in the watershed and not having salmon. The Board should save Misty and other legacy forests in the Chehalis. Future old growth forests are extremely valuable if left standing. No policy or plan requires clearcutting Misty and other legacy forests in Capitol Forest. The forests will help reduce the risk of catastrophic low water levels, high water temperatures, and help combat climate change.

Heath Heikkila thanked the Board and staff for supporting policies improving carbon sequestration capacity of DNR forests through active management, for promoting storage of carbon in wood products, thinning forests to reduce the risk of catastrophic wildfires, and reforesting areas burned by wildfires. The policies are consistent with the recommendations of the (IPCC). IPCC's fourth assessment states that in the long-term, a sustainable forest management strategy aimed at maintaining or increasing forest carbon stocks while producing an annual sustainable yield of timber, fiber, or energy from the forest will generate the largest sustained mitigation benefit. IPCC's Special Report in 2019 indicated sustainable forest management can maintain or enhance forest carbon stocks and maintain forest carbon sinks by transferring carbon to wood products. When wood carbon is transferred to harvested wood products, carbon storage is possible over the long term and can substitute for emissions intensive materials reducing emissions in other sectors. IPCC's sixth assessment in 2022 states that reducing harvests may lead to gains in carbon storage in the forest ecosystems locally, but the gains may be offset through international trade of forest products, causing increased harvesting pressure or even degradation elsewhere. The State of the World Forest in the UN Report forecasts that demand for natural resources will double by 2060 including wood products. It is clearer than ever before it is critical to reduce global greenhouse gas emissions but only when the forests are derived from sustainably managed forests.

Greg Bellamy, Clallam Fire District 5, said the fire district is located 33 miles north of the City of Forks and 52 miles east of the City of Port of Angeles. The fire district is busy with reckless burning incidents. One of the biggest complaints is insufficient enforcement. He is hopeful legislation will provide more tools for the fire district to use. He thanked DNR for its support to the fire district. He reminded everyone that mothers and fathers or brothers and sisters are fighting fires. State timber funding is used to purchase equipment and provide training. Clallam Commissioners are considering options for changing land trust arrangements. He prefers the county not becoming involved. Volunteers are not receiving pay to fight fires and work closely with DNR.

John Anderson, Northwest Hardwoods, reported he works in the Longview facility. He thanked DNR and the Board for the hard work on continuing the sort sale program. As a minor species buyer, it is critical to continue the program as it enables the company to

purchase well-manufactured targeted logs to keep employees working and to provide a tax base for the local economy. The market has encountered problems lately but he is confident the market will return with renewed interest in the sort sale program moving powered by hardwood companies in the state.

David Perk reported he serves as the convener of the Washington State Lands Working Group of the Pacific Northwest Forest Climate Alliance. He referred to an email to the Board on June 29, 2023 containing a letter cosigned by over 25 conservation groups. The letter requested Commissioner Franz commit to bringing a new policy and plan for the protection of mature forests by the end of the year. The letter requests a moratorium on all timber sales containing mature forests until the policy is formulated.

Kendra Smith said she is speaking on behalf of Skagit County. Skagit County is the second larger county recipient of state land revenues providing many jobs in the community and revenues for junior taxing districts and essential county services. Skagit County acknowledges and thanks DNR, staff, and the Board for efforts to offer timber sales. Lightning Talks have been invaluable to help explain and educate the public on what occurs to manage state lands including provisions for the multi-use concept, following natural patterns and layout, and exploring and implementing measures for increased temperatures while meeting the HCP and policies for sustainable forests. There is some disappointment that over 50% of trust lands are set-aside in various protections and not available to support local jobs and needed revenues; however everyone understands the reasoning and supports those efforts. Skagit County believes DNR's new hire of a liaison between DNR and K-12 schools is a great move and was very beneficial in coordinating a teachers workshop in Skagit County.

Sally Keely urged the Board to read and carefully consider action on three requests in a letter the Board received from the Washington State Lands Group of the Pacific Northwest Climate Alliance. The state is experiencing a climate emergency with the forests the best natural climate defense. The Board is urged to implement a mature forest policy that protects remaining structurally complex mature forests and immediately declare a moratorium on the logging of any mature forests. She shared excerpts from a 2021 book, Smokescreen, by Dr. Forests are dynamic shaped for millions of years by numerous natural disturbances of fire, wind, flood, drought, and wood boring insects. Those processes ensured the survival of the strongest trees. Entire groups of plant and animal species have evolved to depend on the habitat created by those processes. In contrast, there is no evolutionary history of logging in forest ecosystems. Logging is an anomaly of the industrial world and one that degrades and eliminates most of the things that define a forest ecosystem while systematically removing carbons from forests and releasing it into the atmosphere. Forest ecosystems are needed to work for the planet undeterred by industrial intervention. She implored the Board to preserve all remaining mature forests and their surrounding protected snag forests that are biodiversity havens.

Joshua Wright said he is in Mason County where 200 residents have been evacuated because of a wildfire. It is no surprise that in the age of a climate crisis, the state is experiencing more wildfire threatening rural communities. Timber sales are not helping. He spoke to 10,000

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20 21

22

23 24

25

26 27

28 29

30 31

32

33

34

35 36 37

38

39

40

41

42

43 44 45

46

1

acres enlisted in the carbon project in 2020. An examination of the areas included in phase 1 and phase 2 as candidate parcels reflected that a significant percentage if not the majority of the areas are not legacy forests. Funding was provided in a budget proviso to protect 2,000 acres. Currently, no avenue is available for the public to provide feedback on areas that should be considered. DNR selected the 10,000 acres in areas not slated for logging. He wants to ensure that areas such as the Misty timber sale and Harstene Flats are prioritized for inclusion in the 2,000 acres. DNR tends to develop timber sales and then go to the community as the last action. The public is not afforded an opportunity to determine the outcome of a forest prior to the Department developing the area into a timber sale. The public should be involved much earlier in the process.

Kyle Krakow said that as a new resident of Washington, he echoes the demands of the Legacy Forests Defense Coalition and many of the other speakers. DNR should stop destroying the state's rarest and oldest forests. Older forests are vital to mitigating the effects of the climate crisis as well as vital to everyone who depends on them for food, shelter, and healing human and non-human alike. While mature structurally complex forests provide a glimpse into the past, they are not static and continue to evolve. Western Washington's oldest forests are unlike any other and are irreplaceable. Auctioning forests for commercial logging is needless and unconscionable and can never be undone.

Michelle Hogg said she lives in Monroe in Snohomish County and is surrounded by DNR stand land. She cited other surrounding land uses and recent logging activity. The area is popular for bonfires all hours of the day and night throughout the year and not just on holidays. Recently, several fires have occurred in the area. One concern is the installation of a gate, which deters access. Today, many cars block the gate and impede access by emergency vehicles to fight any fires, which is of concern to surrounding homeowners. She asked for the gate to enable access for law enforcement, fire, and other first responders.

CHAIR REPORT.

Recreation Briefing - Informational

Kristen Ohlson-Kiehn, Recreation and Conservation Division Manager

Andrea Martin, Assistant Division Manger and Statewide Recreation Manager

Ms. Ohlson-Kiehn presented the second briefing on the Recreation Program and an introduction to the Outdoor Access and Responsible Recreation (OARR) Plan Statewide Recreation Planning process.

At the June meeting, the Board received an overview of the Recreation Program and the three categories of lands managed for aquatic lands, trust lands, and natural areas to include tribal reserve rights to lands. The overview emphasized the importance of the trust mandate in governing how trust lands are managed. The Recreation Program provides a diversity of activities and extensive infrastructure encompassing 80 campgrounds and over 1,300 miles of trails of which 500 miles are motorized. This briefing will cover the program's funding and how the program is implemented, as well as benefits of the program and some challenges.

Information has been updated to reflect the inclusion of funding received from the 2023

ORV and Non-Highway Vehicle (Gas tax refund)
Grants (All RCO Programs)
Discover Pass
General Fund – State Maintenance
State Capital Appropriation

6 7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20 21

22

23

24

25 26

27

28

29

30 31 32

33

34

35 36

37

38

39

40

41

42 43

44

- NOVA (Direct DNR Appropriation)
- RMCA, FDA, and Ag-Trust (Trust Lands Management Accounts Combined used for closing, limiting, or redirecting public access to meet trust objectives or protect trust assets)
- Protect Public Lands and Tribal Rights provides funding for law enforcement

The total budget allocation during the 23-25 biennium is \$25,079,000 to fund an estimated need of \$34,200,000 and includes an additional \$2.2 million in new work requested for Protect Public Lands and Tribal Rights. The estimated amount does not include inflation. Funding for DNR recreation is from several sources. The program does not generate revenue and relies on multiple funding sources requiring staff resources to acquire funding from different sources. DNR receives 8% of the total revenue for the Discover Pass with most of the funds used to fund parks. Land management agencies (Parks, WDFW, & DNR) administer the ORV and Non-Highway Vehicle account and the Recreation and Conservation Office (RCO) administers the NOVA account. In the 2009-2011 biennium, DNR received an appropriation from the NOVA account, which continued to the 2021-2023 biennium. Due to several factors, DNR did not receive an appropriation, as the original intent of the appropriation was a one-time allocation. To resolve the issue, the Legislature directed DNR to work with stakeholders to forward a recommendation on whether the funding should continue for DNR or be returned to RCO. The recommendation returned the funding to RCO. The funds support RCOs grant process enabling DNR to compete for the funds.

For DNR to maintain existing infrastructure, more funds are required resulting in potential impacts related to use unless the Department receives or identifies other funding resources to fund recreation on DNR lands. Those needs created interest in establishing a statewide recreation planning process.

Legislative budget and RCO allocations received for the 23-25 biennium include:

- Recreation Maintenance \$7.9 million
- Additional Law Enforcement \$2.8 million
- Outdoor Access and Responsible Recreation (OARR) Plan \$200,000
- Interagency Tribal coordination \$687,000
- Safe and Sustainable Recreation \$2.9 million
- Conservation Corps \$3 million

DNR recently received confirmation that the Department is funded for three additional NOVA projects for a total funding level of \$4.8 million nearly equaling all grant funding from the 21-23 biennium. The Department did not receive funding for all projects submitted for specific sites. Despite similar funding levels in the last biennium, the Department requested fewer development grant funds because of the focus on maintenance of existing infrastructure to address safety, environmental impacts, and tribal concerns, as well as completing the

3

33

25

Outdoor Access and Responsible Recreation (OARR) Plan to establish a future vision.

The program's workforce is representative of many groups to implement the work of managing recreation across 5.8 million acres. DNR partners with multiple Corps programs typically employing 18 to 25 year-olds on a seasonal basis. They serve as a cost-effective labor force and assist DNR regions in accomplishing high priority projects, as well as offering them an avenue to the natural resource management field. Main programs include Washington Conservation Corps through the Department of Ecology, Washington Division of Northwest Youth Corps, and the Seattle-based Earth Corps. In peak funding years, DNR purchases through the legislature 2,200 crew days equivalent to 48 full-time employees. During the 21-23 biennium, DNR received \$6 million for Conservation Corps to support recreation priorities and other agency programs. In addition to the Conservation Corps, the agency relies on recreation staff, volunteers, and an extensive network of partners to accomplish recreation work.

Recreation planning begins with a landscape plan. Ms. Ohlson-Kiehn shared a map of the locations of 10 landscape plans completed by the agency. The first plan is the Capitol State Forest Recreation and Public Access Plan completed in 2005. The most recent plan is the Baker to Bellingham Non-motorized Plan completed in 2018. The agency's approach to recreation planning has evolved over the years with core components remaining. research known science about the landscape to include biology, geology, and other management data pertinent to the area. The area is assessed for suitable locations for different types of trails and recreation amenities and feedback is solicited from recreational users, neighbors, partners, interest groups, and members of the public. The plans are also supported by advisory committees comprised of various groups to render recommendations to the agency. The plans are drafted and published for the public to review and provide comments. Following the public outreach process and consultation with tribes, the agency analyzes the plans for compliance with the State Environmental Policy Act (SEPA). Most of the plans are located in Western Washington because of the number of population centers. Locations have not been identified for future landscape plans as the agency has lost the funding source and the agency is focusing on generating resources to meet expectations established by the Baker to Bellingham Recreation Plan. Additionally, the agency shifted to a Statewide Recreation Planning Process.

Ms. Ohlson-Kiehn shared a graphic illustrating the relationship between the phases of landscape planning, building, and maintaining recreation infrastructure. The timeline can encompass four to seven years between planning to implementation based on available funding and longer if funding is not received. One proposal by the agency submitted for funding from RCO is a bridge over Olson Creek in Whatcom County. The project is included in the Baker to Bellingham Recreation Plan. Whatcom County has no sanctioned trails on DNR managed lands but does have hundreds of miles of unsanctioned user-built trails not approved by DNR at this time. The number of trail users demonstrates the need for new infrastructure to replace three existing crossings across Olson Creek, a fish-bearing stream. None of the existing crossings provides safe and sustainable access. The construction of a pedestrian crossing over Olson Creek is necessary to provide safe access, remediate environmental issues, and prevent impacts from recreational users on habitat.

11 12

13

14 15

30 31 32

33

34

40 41 42

43 44

45

46

When recreation sites are constructed on trust land, the agency uses leases or restrictive covenants to ensure the trust is compensated for the land. All sites are delineated and recorded with the State Land Survey Office. Any valuable materials on the site are harvested and sold, such as a timber sale to provide revenue to the beneficiaries. Land agreements are completed to ensure beneficiaries are compensated for the underlying land value. Other agreements utilized by the Department include recreation leases, Commissioner Orders, or restrictive covenants. The agency is phasing out the use of recreation leases based on advice from the Attorney General's Office and is using Commissioner Orders, a tool to identify a site for recreation development covering a period of 25 to 50 years.

The main benefit of the Recreation Program is channeling the significant interest in outdoor recreation to areas built to withstand the use and in ways to meet user expectations. DNR also allows for some dispersed activities across lands, such as target shooting by concentrating the use on appropriate infrastructure that can be maintained. The Recreation Program provides an economic contribution to the state. A recent study cited by RCO reflected that the outdoor recreation industry employed nearly 5.2 million individuals in the United States in 2019 and contributed nearly \$460 billion in direct spending to the economy representing 2.1% of the gross domestic product. The economic impacts are 2.4 times greater than oil and gas development, 2.8 times greater than motor vehicle manufacturing, and 3.0 times greater than air transportation. RCO reports visitors to all recreation sites in the state spent nearly 600 million user days in outdoor recreation in 2019 resulting in more than \$26.5 billion in direct spending and supporting 264,000 jobs. For DNR lands, recreation users generated \$730 million in direct spending and supported 4,750 jobs. The 2022 report relies on a model that is recognized as imperfect for DNR because of the challenge of obtaining accurate user data because of the lack of ways to access user entry to sites because of numerous access points. Data for DNR did not include any road systems that serve as a source of public visitation to recreation sites. The program is undergoing a scoping phase for the second phase of the project to increase the accuracy of the data for DNR managed lands.

Additionally, state trust lands provide approximately \$990 million annually in non-market outdoor recreation benefits based on land value, revenue value, and the value of ecosystem services and activities.

Vice Chair Brown asked whether any non-market value is returned to beneficiaries. He questioned attaching a monetary value on benefits accrued to individuals participating in the activity. Ms. Ohlson-Kiehn agreed on the importance of clarifying that the value does not equate to revenue for beneficiaries or to users. The purpose of equating a non-market value is to reflect a measure of social welfare and the cost of any particular activity the user would pay for a similar activity with a private company. The measure is used to demonstrate the importance of the resource.

Ms. Ohlson-Kiehn reviewed other benefits of the Recreation Program:

- Presence on landscape often serving as a deterrent to illegal behaviors
- Tax dollars spent educating users on working forests
- Resources for law enforcement (funding from the 2023 legislative session will add

 five DNR law enforcement officers and one sergeant to help reduce response time for emergencies and complaints, and support the deterrence of illegal activities harming natural and cultural resources)

Recreation Program challenges and opportunities to meet shifting needs and usage include changing technology, user conflict, developed vs. disbursed, unsustainable funding, an increase in demand for recreation, increased tribal concerns regarding recreation impacts, public abuse, and recreation vs. public access.

Ms. Martin briefed members on the Outdoor Access and Responsible Recreation (OARR) Plan.

Recently, DNR contracted with a consultant team from Triangle Associates to lead the facilitation of the external stakeholder process and the agency's support team. With support from Triangle Associates and recent funding from the Legislative, the agency is actively pursuing development of the plan. Ms. Martin cited the numerous reasons for developing the plan to accommodate an increase in outdoor users, the level of visitations is impacting tribal treaty rights, the agency is experiencing impacts to maintain sites and infrastructure, and an increase in impacts to safety, biodiversity, and wildlife.

The goal of the plan is to develop a shared vision for recreation and public access on DNR-managed lands that provide diverse and high-quality recreational opportunities that foster engagement from all communities, promote a strong sense of environmental stewardship, and enriches the quality of life in Washington.

Themes of the OARR Plan is to: (1) preserve and protect the natural environment and cultural resources; (2) build an outdoor stewardship and responsibility ethic; (3) increase equitable access and responsible recreation development, stewardship, and management; (4) secure financial stability for recreation development, stewardship, and management; and (5) mitigate climate impacts and build resilience. The public outreach and engagement process is structured on the five themes. Currently, the agency is extending invitations to interested parties to participate in five facilitated workgroups focusing on each theme. The workgroups will forward recommendations to DNR on projects and initiatives.

Ms. Martin reviewed details of the OARR Plan engagement timeline. Parallel engagements include tribal engagement in July, five workgroups between August and October to develop a list of recommendations on each theme, public engagement process encompassing public notifications, virtual town hall meetings, and meeting directly with organizations. The engagement process will begin in summer 2023 and conclude in October 2024. All recommendations from the process will be utilized to draft the OARR Plan for review by the tribes in spring 2024 and the public. The intent is to publish a complete plan by the end of 2024.

Ms. Ohlson-Kiehn reported the Board's retreat scheduled for August 22-23, 2023, will focus on the Recreation Program in the Northwest Region.

Mr. Cahill inquired about the Board's role with respect to finalization and approval of the

OARR Plan. Ms. Ohlson-Kiehn advised that the strategic plan will include several initiatives that could include policy considerations to pursue. Those policy issues would be presented to the Board. The OARR Plan is scheduled for approval by the Department.

Commissioner Janicki responded that the plan would not only include projects but also a few policy-level issues surrounding access and formation of future funding requests, which could impact the revenue model for recreation. She prefers the Board pursuing a conversation of its role when Commissioner Franz is present. Based on the extent and increase in dumping of garbage on both state and private lands, the issue might warrant policy level decisions initiated by DNR.

Ms. Ohlson-Kiehn acknowledged the concerns as they represent significant challenges the agency encounters.

Vice Chair Brown agreed if the Plan includes policy proposals or funding initiatives generated from the planning process, the intent should include presenting those issues to the Board in addition to Commissioner Janicki's suggestions.

LAND TRANSACTIONS – Action McKinley Bridge Purchase, 08-105235, Resolution 1604 Bob Winslow, Transaction Project Manager, Conservation, Recreation and Transactions

Mr. Winslow recognized and thanked DNR firefighters for their efforts on wildfires in the southern area of the state.

Superintendent Reykdal commented on the number of Fourth of July fireworks incidents and the increase in consumption of alcohol contributing to more accidents on both public and private lands. Air quality in the state has deteriorated significantly within the last 12 hours to the point of affecting recreational activities and creating cancellations. Many students are losing their summer experiences. None of the trust lands will benefit beneficiaries if they are burning. The public does not receive benefits if people must stay inside because of wildfire smoke and other risks. Many issues from a public policy standpoint deserve attention by the Legislature. Sellers of fireworks represent the biggest contributor to wildfire risk and carbon emissions leading to the loss of public dollars. He stressed the importance of the Board pursuing conversations, as there is common interest in increasing law enforcement response by the Department.

Mr. Winslow presented the McKinley Bridge Purchase proposal. The McKinley Bridge property is in Wahkiakum County approximately about 14 miles northeast of Cathlamet. The property is 119.4 acres in size and is forested on class 2 soil, some of the best soil in the state. The property is an in-holding within the Elochoman State Forest. DNR is purchasing the property using legislative funding designed in part to replace some of the state forest trust properties encumbered with timber harvest restrictions because of threatened and endangered animal species.

Trees on the property are 10-12 years in age, except for some older trees in riparian and leave tree areas. Acquiring the property is anticipated to provide benefits through increasing the acreage of state forest timberlands that are anticipated to provide future timber revenue, it would remove a private in-holding within the edge of the state forest landscape, it would reduce road costs through the state ownership and control of the road system, and it enhances opportunities for dispersed low-impact public recreation.

10

The acquisition price of the forest asset is \$495,000 (\$4,155/acre). DNR contacted with Washington State Association of Counties (WSAC) and Wahkiakum County. Both agencies support the proposal. Wahkiakum County is the designated trust beneficiary. Legislative funds used for the purchase are from provisions adopted in ESSB 5187.

11 12 13

Mr. Winslow requested approval of Resolution 1604, approving the purchase of the McKinley Bridge property, 08-105235.

14 15 16

Superintendent Reykdal moved to approve Resolution 1604; McKinley Bridge MOTION: property purchase, 08-105235 as presented.

17 18 19

MOTION: Commissioner Janicki seconded the motion.

20 21

ACTION:

ACTION:

The motion was approved unanimously.

22 23

Ridgetop Land Transfer, 02-102875, Resolution 1605 Robin Hammill, Assistant Division for Strategic Upland Planning

25 26 27

28

29

30

31

32

24

Ms. Hammill reported the proposal is a direct transfer to Kitsap County of an isolated 27.1acre Common School Trust parcel located in Kitsap County near the Ridgetop neighborhood in Silverdale. The property is forested with a portion of the Clear Creek Trail located on it. Designated as a transition land since the 1980s, the parcel is zoned urban high residential. Because of its location and surrounding uses, the parcel is no longer suitable for trust management and has little to no potential to produce revenue for trust beneficiaries. Kitsap County agreed to pay the purchase price of the appraised value of \$5.625 million and DNR's administrative costs. Kitsap County intends to use the property as open space, workforce housing, and a potential fire station.

33 34 35

36

Ms. Hammill requested approval of the proposal.

37 38

Superintendent Reykdal moved to approve Resolution 1605; Ridgetop Land MOTION: Transfer, 02-102875 as presented.

39 40 41

MOTION: Mr. Cahill seconded the motion.

42 43

The motion was approved unanimously.

44 45 46

TIMBER SALES - Action

Auction Results for June 2023, FY 2023 Update, FY24 Outline, & Proposed Timber Sales for August and September 2023

Michael Kearney, Product Sales and Leasing Division Manager

Mr. Kearney presented the results of June timber sales. The Department offered 11 sales totaling 55.9 mmbf for \$10.5 million or \$188 per mbf. DNR sold 10 of the sales except for one small region sale in the Northeast Region to be reoffered in July. In addition to timber sales sold, the auction included reoffering some log sorts that did not receive bids in May. The sold sales in June represent approximately 51.2 mmbf totaling \$16.2 million with an average stumpage price of \$316 per mbf. The auction generated an average of 2.1 bids per sale.

Mr. Kearney invited questions. Vice Chair Brown noted the differences in stumpage price of \$325 mbf within the presentation materials. Mr. Kearney noted the material was inadvertently not edited to reflect the correct figure.

Mr. Kearney reviewed the status of Fiscal Year 23 planned volume. The graph reflects current plan for auction volume, forecasted volume for the remainder of the year, and sold volume. For fiscal year 2023 for Western Washington, sold volume is 403 mmbf. For Eastern Washington, staff projects a sold volume of 63 mmbf. An additional 14 mmbf was sold from previous fiscal years for a total volume of sold timber of 480 mmbf for fiscal year 2023. Revenues for FY 2023 totaled \$185.9 million for an average stumpage price of \$391 per mbf.

Superintendent Reykdal noted that the information reflects less volume but an increase in revenue. He asked about changes occurring in the second quarter. Mr. Kearney advised that the market was active during the second quarter. The volume offered was below the forecasted plan at the beginning of the fiscal year based on staffing and workload issues.

Vice Chair Brown questioned whether the difference sold versus forecasted volume lost during the second quarter would be deferred to the next fiscal year. Mr. Kearney explained that some sales were deferred to the next fiscal year and some sales were placed on hold for various reasons. Overall, the volume offered and sold is less than initially forecasted in the FY plan primarily because of staffing shortages the agency has experienced over the last several years of the pandemic.

Mr. Kearney reviewed a graph of planned volume for fiscal year 2024 for both Western and Eastern Washington. The deliverable goal for the state is \$564 mmbf. Planned sales as of June 22, 2023, total 562 mmbf with 489 mmbf from Western Washington and 65 mmbf from Eastern Washington. The forecast limits any reduction in volume dependent upon each sale, which will be monitored closely by staff to identify any opportunities to make up any lost volume. He referred to a list of the planned sales per harvest unit for both fiscal year 2024 and 25. Staff plans to follow the previous year's practice of offering more volume in the second and third quarters based on the market.

Vice Chair Brown acknowledged the justification for offering more volume during the second and third quarters but pointed out that last year's plan did not result in more volume. He asked whether staff has the workforce ability to offer an uneven plan throughout the fiscal year. Mr. Kearney advised that staff has been addressing the solution as work completed on the front end of the fiscal year on timber sales assists in meeting the forecast and market conditions. Previous discussions centered on efforts to move due dates forward using August as an opportunity to present more proposed sales to maintain timelines rather than contending with last minute deadlines to present sales to the Board.

Vice Chair Brown asked about the volume that is prepared to move forward for sale. Mr. Kearney said some sales are prepared to move forward while other sales require additional preparation and completion of the SEPA process.

Mr. Cahill asked about current staffing level for the timber sales program. Mr. Kearney advised that the agency is close to normal staffing but continues to experience staff turnover with new staff in training. Staff is collecting data on the status of staffing for the Department to present to the Board.

Mr. Kearney presented twelve proposed sales in August and September totaling approximately 50 mmbf of timber with a minimum appraised delivered value of \$10.6 million. The expected delivered price minimum is \$211 per mbf. Three sales are included in the Northeast Region, two sales in the Northwest Region, one sale in the Olympic Region, four sales in the Puget Sound Region, one sale in South Puget Region, and one sale in the Southeast Region. One sale originally included in the proposal was appraised for less than the Board's threshold of \$250,000 in the Olympic Region.

Superintendent Reykdal asked about the status of the activity in the market that might be affecting prices. Mr. Kearney reported the market is relatively stable with some minor fluctuations. Lower sales are more reflective of the type of sale with higher logging costs or transportation costs.

Mr. Kearney reviewed figures for net harvested acres and acres conserved for the proposed sales package and the beneficiaries designated to receive revenue from the sales.

Mr. Kearney invited questions.

Mr. Cahill questioned the type of sale designated for the Q Blowhole timber sale because it is different from a typical timber sale. Duane Emmons, Assistant Deputy for State Uplands, replied that the sale designation of UM represents uneven aged management, which is different from a variable retention harvest or thinning where the harvest is targeting specific areas of the unit for forest health reasons. The unit may contain a number of gaps and skips with understory reflecting a mosaic of ages within the unit. He offered to follow up with additional information.

Mr. Kearney recommended approval of the proposed sales as presented.

1	MOTION:	Mr. Cahill moved to approve the proposed sales for August and September
2		2023 as presented by staff.
3		
4	MOTION:	Commissioner Janicki seconded the motion.
5		
6	ACTION:	The motion was approved unanimously.
7		
8	ADJOURN	MENT
9	With there b	eing no further business, Vice Chair Brown adjourned the meeting at 12:18 p.m.
10		

Approved this 5 day of Septembor, 2023
Approved Ora Webenar Hilary S. Franz, Washington State Commissioner of Public Lands
Jim Cahill, Designee for Governor Jay Inslee
My Canin, Designee for Governor Jay histee
Chris Reykdal, Superintendent of Public Instruction
Lisa Janicki, Commissioner, Skagit County
Dr. Wendy Powers, Dean, College of Agricultural, Human, and Natural Resource Sciences, Washington State University
Diane.
Dan Brown, Director, School of Environmental and Forest Sciences, University of Washington
Attest:
Tami Kellogg, Board Coordinator

Prepared by Valerie L. Gow, Recording Secretary/President Puget Sound Meeting Services, psmsoly@earthlink.net