
Minutes
Board of Natural Resources Meeting
November 2, 2021
“Webinar” in Olympia, Washington

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

The Honorable Hilary Franz, Washington State Commissioner of Public Lands

The Honorable Bill Peach, Commissioner, Clallam County

The Honorable Chris Reykdal, Superintendent of Public Instruction

Jim Cahill, Designee for the Honorable Jay Inslee, Washington State Governor

Dan Brown, Director, School of Environmental and Forest Sciences, University of Washington

Dr. Richard Koenig, Interim Dean, College of Agricultural, Human, and Natural Resource Sciences,
Washington State University

1 **CALL TO ORDER**

2 Chair Franz called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

3
4 Board members present provided self-introduction. A meeting quorum was attained.

5
6 **WEBINAR FORMAT BRIEFING**

7 Ms. Tami Kellogg provided an overview for viewing and participating in a webinar meeting.

8
9 **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

10 Chair Franz called for approval of the minutes for the October 5, 2021 Regular Board of Natural
11 Resources meeting.

12
13 **MOTION:** Dean Koenig moved to approve the minutes.

14
15 **SECOND:** Dr. Brown seconded the motion.

16
17 **ACTION:** The motion carried unanimously.

18
19 **LIGHTNING TALK**

20 **Puget SoundCorps**

21 Andrea Martin, Acting Statewide Recreation Program Manager, Conservation, Recreation and
22 Transactions

23
24 Ms. Martin reported Puget SoundCorps is an agency-wide job creation program engaging young
25 adults and veterans in outdoor work focused on environmental restoration, recreation, natural
26 resource management, and disaster response. The Department utilizes SoundCorps funding to
27 hire conservation corps crews to participate in job training and education programs. Corps

1 members are typically recruited from local communities and often have no background in natural
2 resources or recreation. The program model enables participants to learn new skills in a
3 supportive environment. The program supports recreation, conservation, and aquatics.
4 Recreational tasks include maintenance and operations to maintain trails and facilities, as well as
5 new facility development. Within conservation, crews support weed eradication, monitoring,
6 and planting efforts. Within the Aquatics Division, crews perform landscape level weed
7 eradication in partnership with local entities and tribes, as well as supporting the agency's
8 aquatic program. Crews also support other agency priorities such as forest health and resiliency
9 and wildfire response. DNR also partners with the Washington Conservation Corps housed at
10 the Department of Ecology and with other conservation corps organizations in the state. DNR's
11 program also serves as a valuable recruitment tool for the Department with many conservation
12 corps alumni working throughout the agency in a variety of programs.

13
14 Ms. Martin shared a video highlighting information on the Puget SoundCorps program.

15
16 Ms. Martin responded to questions from several members and explained that the Department
17 does not recruit for the corps program, but relies on other conservation groups for recruitment to
18 fill crew positions in the agency. She is unaware of any recruitment issues during the pandemic.
19 Participants are typically 18 to 25 years of age with many recently graduating from college and
20 exploring employment options. The Density Seed program is supported by the AmeriCorps
21 program with corps members also earning an education award at the end of their service that can
22 be used for continuing education or repayment of student loans.

23
24 Commissioner Franz reminded the Board of her request to staff in March to undertake a policy
25 review of old growth forests. The focus is on the definition of old growth forests. Typically, old
26 growth forests are considered 120-130 years and older totaling approximately 10,000 acres of
27 land managed by DNR. Staff examined the forests in a landscape context and developed some
28 options that consider conservation; climate; changes occurring in forests; social values; and how
29 the Department can manage those stands within the agency's fiduciary responsibility; and if not,
30 ways to possibly compensate the trust. Staff requested delaying the briefing until the December
31 or January Board meeting.

32 33 **PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR GENERAL ITEMS OF INTEREST**

34 **Stephen Kropp** expressed disbelief that the agency continues to clear cut century-old forests in
35 parts of the state where many of the forests no longer exist. Naturally regenerated forests are
36 often included in timber sales. He referred to Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP) goals to retain
37 old growth forests by 2096 and asked why the Board continues to approve senseless and
38 controversial timber sales. It is unnecessary to cut down century-old forests to meet the
39 sustainable harvest targets in the current and previous planning decades.

40
41 *Commissioner Bill Peach joined the meeting at 9:20 a.m.*

42
43 **Andy Zahn** commented on the agency's purported pro-conservation, pro-climate actions, and
44 public image that are continually undermined by a lack of meaningful actions. Commissioner
45 Franz pledged to conserve one million acres of forest, but has since voted to approve massive
46 timber sales in legacy forests including those with remnant old growth trees. He cited other
47 unfulfilled promises and how Department practices have violated many of the agency's policies.

1 DNR is required by its federal permits to restore 22% of state forested land to old growth
2 conditions by 2096. The agency has made little effort to meet those requirements throughout
3 much of the state. DNR must honor its promises and legal obligations. All older forests on state
4 lands must be preserved by adopting a moratorium on timber sales of state forest lands and
5 naturally generated forests prior to 1945.

6
7 **Court Stanley, Washington State Association of Counties (WSAC)**, emphasized the
8 importance the trust provides to counties for employment opportunities, economic benefits, and
9 strategies that help sustain and increase benefits to rural counties. Good forest stewardship
10 should include active and responsible management. WSAC supports the balancing of harvesting
11 of forest products, protection of water, air, habitat, biodiversity, and mitigating climate change.
12 It is possible to sequester and store carbon by establishing programs and policies that continue to
13 ensure the health and productivity of the forests. WSAC supports carbon trading and believes it
14 is an emerging market for providing additional revenue in conjunction with current forest
15 products.

16
17 **Daniel Harm** voiced opposition of clearcutting. Legacy forests are different than tree
18 plantations blanketing Western Washington. Legacy forests are unique, biodiverse, and
19 structurally complex and will become fully functional old growth forests. Current logging
20 practices make it impossible for DNR to maintain a specific percentage of older growth forests.
21 The Board should adopt a temporary moratorium of all timber sales in state forested land
22 naturally regenerated prior to 1945.

23
24 **John Talberth, President, Center for Sustainable Economy & Co-director of the Forest**
25 **Harvest Coalition**, referred to the international climate summit of world leaders in Scotland and
26 the agreement announced by 100 countries to end deforestation and forest degradation by 2030.
27 That action should serve as a wake-up call for the Board to act on expediting the transition to a
28 climate smart management regime on DNR lands to protect all remaining tracts of unplanted
29 legacy forests, replace clearcutting, road building, and other carbon intensive practices with
30 variable density thinning and ecological restoration to repopulate the landscape with trees. The
31 Board should delay approving five timber sales because they would create harmful climate
32 impacts including the logging of carbon-rich older forests. The emission factors as reported
33 would generate between 200,000 and 400,000 tons of CO2 pollution, well in excess of the
34 10,000-ton rule of thumb threshold used by the Department of Ecology in a SEPA context. The
35 Board should ensure climate change and opportunities for carbon revenues are factored into
36 sustainable harvest calculations for all timber sales rather than relying on an outdated forest and
37 state model that does not account for climate change.

38
39 **Tom Lannen, Skamania County Commissioner**, thanked and acknowledged the Board and
40 DNR for its work on promoting House Bill 1168 for wildfire efforts. Revenues received from
41 DNR forest sales are necessary for the county's budget. He thanked DNR staff in the Southwest
42 Region for their efforts to pursue timber sales, which provides revenue to the county accounting
43 for 15% of its operating budget over the last 10 years.

44
45 **Mary Jean Ryan, resident of Jefferson County**, advocated for saving older, structurally
46 complex forests on the Toandos Peninsula. As leaders of the state's forest policy, the Board
47 should consider the future direction of DNR because of the actions by the leaders of the world in

1 Glasgow deliberating on climate change and how the status quo must stop as the threat of climate
2 crisis to the planet is so extreme. The Board should press the pause button because clearcutting
3 older forests removes them permanently. With so many forest policy fundamentals under
4 review, it is difficult to know the future direction of DNR. She is hopeful the Board has the
5 motivation and the courage to lead the state forward and stop business as usual. The leaders
6 meeting in Glasgow could use the state's strong support.
7

8 **Matt Comisky, American Forest Resource Council (AFRC)**, reported on his recent tour of
9 several forest fire sites in Eastern Washington. One of the fires impacted state trust lands and
10 threatened private lands near Winthrop and Twisp. DNR is seriously exploring forest health
11 work on trust lands and it likely will be part of the evaluation for the new Eastside Sustainable
12 Harvest Calculation. He stressed the importance of implementing forest health practices prior to
13 wildfires. Green treatments are both economically and ecologically positive. He encouraged the
14 Department to continue its work with partners and adjacent landowners to help prevent wildfires.
15

16 **Miguel Perez-Gibson, Washington Environmental Council (WEC)**, spoke to the importance
17 of the Board considering how the previous sustainable harvest calculation played a role in the
18 proposed timber sales. The Board approved the sustainable harvest calculation of 465 mmbf for
19 the decade ending in 2024. The prior decade included a sustainable harvest level of 597 mmbf
20 during the change in administration from Commissioner Belcher to Commissioner Sutherland.
21 At that time, six alternatives were considered and the Board directed DNR to use innovative
22 silvicultural practices (biodiversity pathways) to create more structurally diverse forests as a
23 priority for habitat across the landscape. The issue is whether silvicultural practices were
24 pursued over that time. In 2004, WEC filed litigation claiming the calculation as invalid as it did
25 not comply with SEPA. A settlement resulted in a change from 597 mmbf to 550 mmbf.
26

27 **Peter Goldman, Washington Forest Law Center**, conveyed support of Mr. Kropp and
28 Mr. Talberth's comments. He asked the Board and DNR to postpone commencing the 2025-34
29 Sustainable Harvest Calculation process until the Washington Supreme Court issues a ruling in
30 the case of *Conservation Northwest vs. Franz* and after AFRC's lawsuits on the 2015-2024
31 sustainable harvest calculation are settled. He contended it would be impossible for DNR to
32 continue establishing the sustainable harvest calculation until the Department receives guidance
33 from the courts, which is anticipated to occur in spring 2022.
34

35 **Robert Mitchell** supported Mr. Zahn's comments regarding the Board's unanimous approval of
36 timber sales at the last meeting. As representatives of the public, the Board should consider the
37 numerous petitions for redress of grievances. He thanked DNR for opening a gate he
38 complained about at the last meeting and for the new trails at the upper Clearwater NRCA. He
39 cited numerous detrimental practices and discarded materials left after logging activities and
40 suggested DNR should not judge the public guilty without the benefit of a trial by closing public
41 access when many individuals often help to clean up trash. The pending Okanogan land option
42 should be marketed for climate funds as a provider of ecosystem services to monetize rather than
43 logging. The Board should vote against the proposed Capra sale because it includes beautiful
44 and unique trees that can provide more value as ecosystem services rather than logs for schools.
45

46 **Ronald Richards** referred to Commissioner Franz's introductory comments and suggested that
47 rather than listening to the public, the comment misconstrues the Washington State Constitution

1 that requires DNR to hold land in trust “for all the people” not just managed solely for specific
2 beneficiaries. The use of cross-laminated timber and other construction uses will not store
3 carbon over the next 40 years to the extent as leaving 40 to 80-year old forested lands intact.
4 Heat from the summer devastated many of his one-to four-year old trees on his tree farm near
5 Port Angeles. With increasing temperatures and decreasing moisture over the summers, it is
6 doubtful DNR could continue to replant clearcuts successfully.
7

8 **Samantha Krop** acknowledged that while most old growth forested land is gone, many pockets
9 exist of mature, native, and complex forests managed by DNR. Those forests represent old
10 growth of the future and the state’s legacy forests. Many conservation organizations and
11 community members spoke against the proposed timber sales and many have submitted written
12 comments and formal letters of opposition. The social, ecological, and climate benefits of legacy
13 forests are worth far more than timber revenue. Clearcutting is not a form of balanced forest
14 management. Washington’s older forests can significantly mitigate and build resilience against
15 climate change but only if they remain intact. The Board should delay approving the Bluehorse
16 and Point Blank sales and the auctions of Crush, and Green Thomas, and institute a moratorium
17 on all future timber sales.
18

19 **Sarah Gardam, resident of Wahkiakum County**, spoke in opposition to DNR’s underlying
20 assumptions to justify DNR’s trust mandate and the decision to clearcut complex bioforests and
21 replant with poor substitutes. Society falsely assumes forests belong to humans and this
22 assumption underlies the trust mandate. The current global environmental realities demand
23 critical thinking and urgent actions. DNR’s current approach is widely in opposition to today’s
24 climate crisis. Many residents know that forests deserve far more respect and many object to the
25 assumptions behind the poorly justified clearcutting under the name of forest management. It is
26 time for DNR to be on the right side of history and heed the will of the people. The Board
27 should find more creative and sustainable ways to generate revenue.
28

29 **Sherri Dysart, resident of Mason County**, questioned the responsible party for carrying the
30 burden of proof during an adaptive management process. Washington’s Marbled Murrelet
31 population continues to decline by 4% each year on average since monitoring was initiated in
32 2001, representing a loss of approximately 4,902 Marbled Murrelets over the past 20 years.
33 Permitting extensive logging within the historical range of Marbled Murrelets has been a factor
34 in the decline. Natural resource management decisions should be based on precautionary
35 principles of shifting the burden of proof to the proponents of an activity, taking preventive
36 action in the face of uncertainty, and exploring a wider range of alternatives to avoid possible
37 harmful actions.
38

39 **Erik Steinhoff, resident of Thurston County**, read a letter addressed to Commissioner Franz
40 and the Board from the Legacy Forest Project dated October 27, 2021. The letter addresses
41 concerns by residents in South Puget Sound of the ongoing clear cut logging of mature, naturally
42 regenerated forests. The letter included three policy recommendations.
43

44 **Ed Bowen, citizen of Clallam County**, commented on how older forests affects his
45 survivability and his junior taxing district. He is concerned about deferred sales and whether
46 they will be reoffered in lieu of staff working on old growth policies. He has been unable to
47 contact staff to access information on the disposition of deferred sales. The region needs to

1 adequately prepare for the potential of Cascadia rising awhile ensuring a reliable source of
2 revenue.

3
4 **PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR TIMBER SALE ACTION ITEMS**

5 **Stephan Kropp** reported the proposed timber sales are some of the most environmentally
6 destructive timber sales ever proposed. He asked the Board to consider written comments and
7 reject the timber sales.

8
9 **Andy Zahn** asked for the cancellation of all proposed timber sales because they are all legacy
10 forests that must be preserved. Additionally, timber auctions must be canceled for Green
11 Thomas, About Time, Crush, On the Line, Beaver Valley, and Serenity Now as they represent
12 the last remnants of wild forests and the Department's best chance of meeting its promises to the
13 public and its legal obligations to the federal government.

14
15 **Matt Comisky, American Forest Resource Council (AFRC)**, acknowledged product sales
16 staff for offering HCP-compliant timber sales to the market. Revenue from the sales is
17 appreciated by beneficiaries and enables purchasers to meet wood product demands of the
18 country, as well as sequestering and storing carbon in completed wood products. Legacy forests
19 are yesterday's clear cuts and broadcast burns the industry ignored at a time when the industry
20 had not adopted reforestation policies to accelerate the planting and growth of trees. Calls for
21 more bidders for timber auctions requires a diversity of products to increase the bidder pool.
22 Calls for longer rotations on state trust lands reveal that most of DNR's rotations are in the 60 to
23 80-year timeframe. Concerns about harvested trees older than 70 to 80 years old is confusing as
24 the goal is to increase the bidder pool while many community members and groups want to limit
25 the diversity of product offered for auction.

26
27 **Miguel Perez-Gibson, Washington Environmental Council (WEC)**, recommended that in
28 addition to the Board's review of old growth forest policies, an in-depth examination should be
29 conducted of all policies for management of older forests from the context of the Board's
30 policies for sustainable forests with an emphasis on meeting older forest targets. Some of the
31 issues today are reflective of whether the management of older forests meet the retention and
32 goals of the HCP.

33
34 **Sherri Dysart, resident of Mason County**, asked the Board to protect older forests on state
35 lands as they represent the future of old growth trees required by the planet. A moratorium
36 should be adopted on all timber sales in state forested lands that have naturally regenerated prior
37 to 1945. Rather than logging legacy forests, the Board should work with DNR to assess options
38 for continuing to meet obligations to trust beneficiaries while also complying with HCP
39 requirements.

40
41 **Ed Bowen, citizen of Clallam County**, requested information on planned sales by location for
42 fiscal years 2022 and 2023. Proposed timber sales include no sales for Clallam County, which
43 offers no revenue predictability for the county. Prior completed auctions also do not include any
44 sales for Olympic Peninsula. Clallam County continues to experience a significant number of no
45 bids. The Olympic regional sale of Sekiu Cedar was sold for over \$38,000, which represents a
46 minimal amount produced from the county's trust lands.

1 **TIMBER SALES (Action Item)**
2 **Auction Results for October 2021 & Proposed Timber Sales for December 2021**
3 Koshare Eagle, Product Sales & Leasing Division
4

5 Ms. Eagle presented the results of the October 2021 auctions. The Department offered 13 sales
6 totaling 42.5 mmbf. Of those, nine sales sold totaling \$10.3 million for an average of \$392 per
7 mbf with 3.2 bidders per sale on average.
8

9 Ms. Eagle invited questions.
10

11 Mr. Cahill asked why no bids were offered on the three sales that did not sell. Ms. Eagle advised
12 that feedback reflected that the minimum bids were higher than the companies could offer based
13 on reconstruction and logging costs for the timber. Staff plans to reassess the sales packages to
14 determine a reasonable minimum bid for auction in the future.
15

16 Dr. Brown pointed out that the auction also received more bids than typical. He asked why those
17 sales received higher than a normal number of bids. Ms. Eagle explained that smaller sales, such
18 as the Longmont sale with 971 mbf tend to attract more bidders. Typically, smaller sales attract
19 a higher number of bidders.
20

21 Commissioner Peach asked whether the no-bids would be reoffered within the next six months.
22 Ms. Eagle confirmed the sales would be reoffered within the next six months.
23

24 Ms. Eagle presented five proposed timber sales for November totaling 26.4 mmbf with minimum
25 bids of \$9.6 million for an average minimum bid of \$362 mbf.
26

27 Ms. Eagle invited questions. No questions were offered by the Board. Ms. Eagle requested
28 approval of the proposed timber sales.
29

30 MOTION: Commissioner Peach moved to approve the proposed sales.
31

32 SECOND: Dr. Brown seconded the motion.
33

34 ACTION: The motion was approved unanimously.
35

36 **PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR LAND TRANSACTIONS ACTION ITEMS**

37 **Andy Zahn** reiterated his belief that the action by the Board was shameful as it reflects the
38 Board ignoring public comment and its legal and moral obligations. It is appalling the
39 Department is considering selling public lands, especially scenic lands. To consider the land as
40 underperforming because it does not generate much revenue, demonstrates a backwards notion
41 of public lands and their value. The land provides valuable habitat for many species of wildlife
42 and a wide range of ecosystems and carbon sequestration. The land should be preserved rather
43 than sold.
44

45 **Ed Bowen, citizen of Clallam County**, reported on his participation in the Trust Land Transfer
46 Workgroup and his concerns about future land transactions in the context of a unified trust. He
47 asked that Superintendent Reykdal speak to his goals regarding future land transactions.

1
2 **LAND TRANSACTIONS (Action)**

3 **Okanogan 2019 Parcel I Auction, #02-099667, Resolution 1580**

4 Bob Winslow, Program Manager, Conservation, Recreation and Transactions Division

5
6 Mr. Winslow displayed an aerial map of the proposed land transaction and identified the location
7 of Parcel I located in Okanogan County. Parcel I is comprised of 160 acres and was converted to
8 land bank ownership in January 2021. The property has no legal road access, is relatively steep,
9 has no irrigation rights, and is currently leased for \$173 annually for grazing. The parcel is
10 zoned Rural with a density of 20 units per acre.

11
12 Outreach for the proposed auction began in October 2019 with notices to tribes, state agencies,
13 legislators, and the county. A Land Bank 2019 public hearing was conducted in November 14,
14 2019 and was publicized through legal and media releases. A public informational meeting in
15 Twisp was held on December 12, 2019. In January 2021, the Board approved the parcel as a
16 land bank. Should the Board approve the transaction the Department plans to include a webpage
17 on the proposed auction.

18
19 Benefits from the auction include funds from the under-performing trust land to purchase higher
20 income trust properties, as well as placing more private land onto Okanogan County's tax base.
21 Staff recommends a minimum bid of \$88,000 for 160 acres based on the Department's
22 evaluation of the property value.

23
24 Mr. Winslow invited questions from the Board.

25
26 Commissioner Franz pointed out that the proposed action is a result of the Department exploring
27 and evaluating low-performing properties while acknowledging that many of those properties are
28 likely high in ecological value; however, the proposal provides an opportunity for the
29 Department to receive funding to purchase more ecologically valuable as well as economically
30 valuable properties.

31
32 Angus Brodie, Deputy Supervisor for State Uplands, added that as part of the Trust Land
33 Performance Assessment with assistance by Deloitte that also included an evaluation of
34 ecosystem services of state trust lands, the overall portfolio of state trust lands was evaluated for
35 performance in terms of generating revenue and ecosystem services value. One of the
36 recommendations in the report was improving the portfolio and considering a continued land
37 transactions program to consolidate the land base for easier management, as well as gauging the
38 benefits of ecosystem services. The land bank mechanism has been used to evaluate properties
39 that border on the margins of the portfolio to sell properties and reinvest the funds in other
40 properties to help consolidate the Department's land base. Staff is also working on another
41 mechanism with a group of stakeholders on the Trust Land Transfer tool with a proposal
42 scheduled for presentation to the Board at the December meeting to revamp and revitalize the
43 program.

44
45 Commissioner Franz invited questions from the Board on the proposal.

1 Mr. Cahill expressed appreciation for the continued actions to bring proposals forward as it is a
2 good way to reduce overall management costs while improving options for the Department to
3 earn revenue and identify other timberlands to protect.
4

5 MOTION: Commissioner Peach moved to approve Resolution 1580.
6

7 SECOND: Dean Koenig seconded the motion.
8

9 ACTION: The motion was approved unanimously.
10


11 **RECESS TO EXECUTIVE SESSION**

12 Commissioner Franz recessed the meeting at 10:43 a.m. for an executive session to discuss
13 anticipated litigation, pending litigation, or any matter suitable for Executive Session under
14 RCW 42.30.110 for approximately 45 minutes. No action will follow the executive session.
15

16 **RECONVENE & ADJOURNMENT**

17 Commissioner Franz reconvened and adjourned the meeting at 11:22 a.m.

Approved this 7th day of December, 2021



Hilary S. Franz, Washington State Commissioner of Public Lands

Approved via Webinar

Jim Cahill, Designee for Governor Jay Inslee

Absent

Chris Reykdal, Superintendent of Public Instruction

Approved via Webinar

Bill Peach, Commissioner, Clallam County

Approved via Webinar

Dr. Richard Koenig, Interim Dean, College of Agricultural, Human, and Natural Resource Sciences,
Washington State University

Approved via Webinar

Dan Brown, Director, School of Environmental and Forest Sciences,
University of Washington

Attest:



Tami Kellogg, Board Coordinator

Prepared by Valerie L. Gow, Puget Sound Meeting Services, psmsoly@earthlink.net